Mainstreaming GPP in the Nordic countries
– a scoping study

This report contains the results of a scoping study on the potential for mainstreaming green public procurement in the Nordic countries. The report gives recommendations on how green public procurement can be better integrated in other policy areas. The study was financed by the Nordic Council of Ministers’ Working group on Sustainable Consumption and Production.
Mainstreaming GPP in the Nordic countries – a scoping study

Isa-Maria Bergman, Annie Ståhlberg, Rikke Dreyer, Martin Standley and Elva Rakel Jonsdottír

TemaNord 2012:504
# Content

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Objectives and methodology</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. General remarks and country specific observations</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Responsibility and networks</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Policy implementation</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Tools and templates</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Capacity building</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Recommendations to the Nordic environmental authorities</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Responsibilities and networks</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Policy implementation</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Monitoring</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Tools and templates</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 Capacity building</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 Raising awareness on the use of the Eco labels</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Appendix 1 Scoping Mainstreaming – Denmark Points of investigation</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Policy responsibility</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Competence</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Support functions (name, function, funding and responsible</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>organization)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Procurement management</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Appendix 2 Scoping mainstreaming – Norway</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Policy responsibility</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Competence</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Support functions (Name, function, funding and responsible</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>organization)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 Procurement management</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Appendix 3 Scoping mainstreaming – Iceland</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1 Policy responsibility</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 Competence</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 Support functions (Name, function, funding and responsible</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>organization)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4 Procurement management</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Appendix 4 Scoping Mainstreaming – Sweden</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Policy responsibility</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 Competence</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3 Support functions (Name, function, funding and responsible</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>organization)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4 Procurement management</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
8. Appendix 5 Scoping Mainstreaming – Finland ......................................................... 51
   8.1 Policy responsibility ......................................................................................... 51
   8.2 Capacity building ......................................................................................... 53
   8.3 Support functions (name, function, funding and responsible organization) ......................................................................................... 54
   8.4 Procurement management ............................................................................. 57
9. Sammanfattning .................................................................................................. 61
   9.1 Rekommendationer ......................................................................................... 61
Preface

The global market for green solutions is set to take off, and the Nordic Region has the potential to improve both its ecological resilience and market position. Green Public Procurement, GPP, has been an environmental policy instrument in the Nordic countries since the late 90’s and is today by the Nordic Prime minister’s commission considered as one of the 8 most important efforts achieving a successful Nordic Green Growth as well as influencing the EU Green Market.

Most countries have adopted National Action Plans on Sustainable Public Procurement and are seen as frontrunners in the European context. Co-operation under the auspices of the Nordic Council of Ministers has been successful in bringing mutual understanding of the common obstacles to greening public sector spending and in influencing EU policy making. One result of the Nordic welfare system is a large and well organized public sector, which is also an important market player as far as investments and procurement are concerned. Public procurement accounts for 16% of GDP in the Nordic countries, and for certain products the public sector is the single biggest buyer. There is no doubt that public procurement can play a major role in influencing the private sector to develop greener products, services and technology in the Nordic countries.

Albeit being frontrunners, implementation of sustainable procurement habits in Nordic public authorities has not been realised to the aspired extent. One of the reasons for this is that GPP still is developed and promoted as an environmental policy instrument, separate from most other public procurement policy making. Thus, a strong need for mainstreaming GPP has been identified. This report is a first mapping of the potential for mainstreaming GPP in the Nordic countries by analysing the whole policy environment affecting public procurement. There is much to be gained by the Nordic countries working more closely together to co-ordinate policy actions for GPP.

The project was financed by the Nordic Council of ministers Working Group for Sustainable Consumption and Production.

Halldór Ásgrímsson
Secretary General
Nordic council of ministers
Summary

Green public Procurement is still largely an environmental policy instrument in the Nordic countries developed separately from other public procurement policy measures. Policies on for instance energy, innovation, competition and e-governance all consider public procurement and make way for improving and facilitating procurement procedures and informed choices in the public sector. The scoping exercise done in Finland, Sweden, Denmark, Norway and Iceland shows a lot of potential linkage between GPP and the other policy developments. Environmental aspects and life cycle considerations should be a part of these developments, providing the necessary tools to facilitate getting the best value for public money spent. If not, the risk of GPP remaining an separate issue for public authorities to consider when appropriate and in a variety of differing ways confusing the market, is considerable.

Recommendations

The scoping exercise was conducted by the project partners in the 5 countries using a common template including the following key aspects: responsibility and networks for public procurers, policy implementation, monitoring, tools and templates and capacity building.

Based on the results the report presents a number of suggestions to the Nordic Council of Ministers’ Working Group on Sustainable Consumption and Production. A main recommendation is to engage in a discussion with other policy areas on GPP, for instance those concerned with energy and innovation policy. An improved dialogue would enable a realisation of the several results of previously published reports of the SCP Working Group on GPP.

An important common deficit in all countries relates to statistical information on public procurement. The national electronic systems for public tendering and the different eProcurement solutions under development could facilitate monitoring of GPP. Life cycle costing should be integrated in general and product or sector specific procurement tools.
Background

Green Public Procurement (GPP) has been an important strategy for achieving environmental goals for the past 10 years, especially in the Northern European and some Asian Countries. Sustainable Public Procurement (SPP = GPP + economic and social aspects) was also identified as a focus area at the Johannesburg Summit and is being implemented in 10–14 developing countries as pilot projects by the Marrakech Task Force lead by Switzerland.

GPP is usually considered part of Environmental politics and as such is implemented and followed up by Environmental Authorities.

In parallel with this, many countries have now a strong focus on improving public procurement (PP) in general – focusing on opening up international markets, ensuring fair competition and SME participation, reducing corruption, stimulating innovation, Green Growth, etc. These activities lie usually under Ministries of Economic Affairs, Market and/or Trade and Industry.

In both areas (GPP and PP) new methods and tools are being developed at a high rate. Both areas are establishing marketing channels to target groups: top managers, procurement directors and procurement officers, through help desks, networks, courses, conferences and internet tools

This opens the question as to whether potential synergies between these areas are being realised – especially given that PP is moving fast towards electronic tools (eProcurement), which could make GPP both simpler if environmental considerations are incorporated, or more difficult if not.

The topic of Mainstreaming GPP into PP was discussed in Stockholm at the GPP-11 meeting on 25 November 2009. Participants agreed that this was a topic that had potential for improvement and that this potential was likely to increase in the future. The EU Commission presented that mainstreaming GPP to include the following aspects:

- Capacity building through PP networks
- Integration in e-procurement
- Monitoring and statistics

Thus, the Nordic Council of Ministers’ working group on Sustainable Consumption and production has initiated a scoping study to identify synergies for mainstreaming GPP in the different Nordic countries.
1. Objectives and methodology

The objective of the scoping study was to identify potential synergies between the current development in public procurement and green public procurement respectively, and to give recommendations to the Nordic environmental authorities on how to mainstream GPP.

The scoping study was conducted by a questionnaire that was filled out by each national partner in the five Nordic countries. The results for each country are found below as attachments 1–5. The partners represented the focal points of GPP in each country and were thus most capable of identifying synergies both on policy and operational level.

The outputs of the scoping study are:

- an overview of PP and GPP activities in the 5 Nordic countries
- an analysis on where the activities overlap and where synergies can be realized now and within the coming 3 years
- a comparison between the countries
2. General remarks and country specific observations

2.1 Responsibility and networks

On a general level the policy level responsibility of GPP and PP seems to be divided in all five countries. The responsibility of the national Action Plan on GPP lies at the Environmental Ministry or Agency, whereas the Finance/Administration Ministry usually leads the development of public procurement. The co-operation at policy level seems to be more led by GPP. As such a stronger commitment to mainstreaming is needed at ministry level.

Helpdesks and consultancy on GPP and PP are often in different organizations, except in Norway.

Norway and Denmark have more systematic networking on different levels. From a mainstreaming perspective the existing networks are an important factor and should be acknowledged also at policy level.

2.2 Policy implementation

2.2.1 Energy policy

Energy efficiency in PP according to the Energy end-use efficiency and energy services Directive (2006), the Energy Labeling Directive and the clean vehicles Directive (2009) are separated from GPP at policy level. This means that there are parallel activities taking place at national level, one lead by the Ministry responsible for energy policy and the other by the Environment Ministry.

Only in Sweden has the mainstreaming potential at operational level been put into practice. As a result of the Energy Service Directive, the Swedish Energy Agency has the assignment to coordinate the energy efficient measures, including energy efficiency in procurement that the public sector ought to implement. SEMCO has an assignment from the Energy Agency on the parts concerning GPP.

This assignment includes support, training and other information on the procurement of energy efficient products. This means that all state support to municipalities for energy efficiency actions goes through the GPP centre of expertise, SEMCO.
This is an important signal to the fundees, that not only what you buy, but also how you buy makes a difference. In several countries, for instance purchasing of Energy Service Contracting (ESCO), which is partly funded by the government, has proven itself difficult and municipalities have been brought to court for poor procurement.

The implementation of EU Directives in the Nordic countries differs and this has also implications for mainstreaming GPP.

2.2.2 Innovation policy

The innovation policies generally point out public procurement as one means to increase innovations, especially in SMEs. There are initiatives in several countries relating to GPP and innovation, however primarily led by the ministries responsible for innovation policy.

In Finland Motiva runs a public environmental technology helpdesk, with the aim of helping public purchasers to buy new solutions and also to use innovative procurement procedures. The Finnish Fund for Technology and Innovation, TEKES, has a funding tool for public procurement of innovation and many of the funded projects so far have concerned environmental innovations.

In Denmark the EPA is involved in creating public-private partnerships to find out potential areas of co-operation in environmental innovations by identifying strategic areas in which municipalities face environmental problems.

Within its innovation forum SEMCO acts in the national substitution group with stimulating environmental innovations to substitute dangerous substances in health care products. One result of this work is a substitution list of more environmentally friendly products. Supply side dialogues and seminars are organized to further promote the development of innovations and to enhance competence.

SEMCO will also promote the use of different procurement methods in procurement of innovation and environmental technology procurement. The Swedish government will fund the implementation of an innovation strategy with 400 million SEK in 2011–2014.

In Norway, the Ministry of Trade and Industry funds a project in Difi to integrate innovation into both PP and GPP.

2.2.3 Monitoring

GPP is monitored on an ad hoc basis and often by questionnaires and wide assumptions. GPP monitoring has e.g. in Finland been done by a number of organizations and has not been synchronized at central level.

Monitoring PP is done as an EU-obligation from a certain threshold level. This is done by electronic means using the statistical information on procurement levels at hand.
2.3 Tools and templates

There are a number of tools, templates and standard documents for public purchasers. Tools for PP hardly ever include environmental aspects and are widely being used by public authorities. These are often developed for the organizations responsible for PP or by local authority organizations. The potential for mainstreaming GPP by including environmental aspects as a standard item is huge.

There are recent examples of frameworks agreement systems where the environmental aspects in particular have been communicated. This is a good development and example of mainstreaming GPP. Standard contracts, templates, e-procurement and e-tools should facilitate GPP in this way.

Tools for PP and GPP respectively are in most cases available on different websites. One exception is Norway, where they have gathered tools and information on both GPP and PP in one place, www.anskaffelser.no.

There are tools for life-cycle cost assessment, LCC, in almost all countries, often relating to energy using products and developed by organizations responsible for energy policy. On top of that, studies on environmental cost accounting have been conducted in both Denmark and Norway, which also relate to public procurement. In Sweden, LCC is an integral part of criteria development and is, when relevant, presented as one criterion among others.

LCC as such is however not a part of any standard tools or templates for PP in any of the Nordic countries. As LCC is not purely a tool for GPP, but also for cost-efficiency in general, there is huge potential in mainstreaming GPP through including LCC-thinking in PP-policies.

2.4 Capacity building

Capacity building represents a challenge in all countries. Training in PP and GPP is often provided by a number of law firms or consultants.

The questions then arise: how are different training organizations cooperating? Do the trainers have up to date information on new developments in GPP and environmental information on products and services?

There is also a challenge in getting the smaller municipalities in the more periphery areas to receive training. To be able to reach out all over the country Norway has developed a concept of change agents, where the regional procurement organizations (usually the county council authorities) have been trained to give training in GPP. So far, however, the amount of training given by the regional authorities has been scarce.

SEMCO provides GPP training on a continuous basis and will offer series of seminars throughout the country in co-operation with the county councils.
E-learning is quite underdeveloped both in PP and GPP. Sweden is the only country which has an e-learning package on GPP. Some consultants offer e-learning for PP.

The procurement competence is generally quite low at local level. Thus, capacity building in how to be a good procurer is needed. This is more or less a prerequisite for raising public sector capabilities also in GPP. Capacity building in both is needed, especially at local level.

Norway, Finland and Denmark have, together with Sweden as the lead country, submitted an application for EU-funding for GPP capacity building in the Baltic Sea states.
3. Recommendations to the Nordic environmental authorities

3.1 Responsibilities and networks

There should be a stronger commitment to mainstream GPP at policy level in all the Nordic countries. Without this GPP will continue to be treated as an environmental policy tool.

Recommendations
The Nordic environmental authorities need to be more active in the initiatives concerning development of PP and also in reaching out to other than GPP networks.

3.2 Policy implementation

3.2.1 Energy policy

The work within the Energy Service Directive and the Directive on Energy Labelling 2010/30/EU concerning public procurement should be closely linked to activities in GPP at EU and Member State level. The new green vehicles directive also brings potential for mainstreaming and its implementation should be done in close co-operations between transport ministries and environmental ministries.

Where the government is giving state funding for energy efficiency or renewable energy investments, the procurement process leading to the investment should also be acknowledged. The model adopted in Sweden serves as a good example.

Recommendations
- The SCP working group should raise this at EU-level and each participating national authority at national level
- The SCP working group should also have a dialogue with the Nordic working group on energy efficiency, where implementation issues and PP also are being discussed
3.2.2 **Innovation policy**

Synergies between the EU Innovation policy and GPP should also be lifted more concretely at both EU and Member State level.

It is also important to build on the conclusions from earlier eco-innovation procurement projects and ongoing innovation policy development in the Nordic countries. For instance, the results from the *Technology procurement* project and the *Innovative Green Public procurement of Construction, IT and Transport services in Nordic countries* would be very important input to the EU Innovation Union flagship project.

**Recommendations**

- The SCP working group should more actively proceed in communicating the results from previously published reports and in putting their recommendations into practice. Particularly the recommendation on spreading and multiplying best practices at the Nordic level should be implemented.
- The SCP working group should strengthen the dialogue on innovations and GPP with the Nordic Innovation Centre, NICe.
- The SCP working group should also make relevant stakeholders aware of the forthcoming EU Calls relating to public procurement of innovation in 2011. The SCP-group could make preparations for a joint Nordic project application in the forthcoming EU Calls on the CIP EIP (DG ENT), 7th framework program on green ICT (INFSO) or the development of public procurement networks (DG ENV), for instance by arranging a workshop for drafting a Nordic application.
- There is also a need to enhance the co-operation between the Nordic GPP centers of expertise in general on the issue of innovative public procurement.

3.3 **Monitoring**

There are considerable synergies to be realized in combining GPP with other monitoring of PP. This should also include monitoring of any public procurement activities arising from EU Directives, such as the Energy Service Directive and the clean vehicles directive. PP reporting to the EU is done annually whereas GPP is monitored ad hoc.

The EU has developed a methodology for monitoring GPP and it should be assessed whether this could be included in general monitoring of PP. There are synergies to be found in combining these issues in monitoring and the result would be a more accurate picture of both the cost benefit and environmental effects of public procurement as a whole. This in turn would of course set the basis for a holistic decision making at EU-level.
Recommendations
- The SCP working group should take this question forward both at EU and national levels

3.4 Tools and templates

Standard contracts, templates, e-procurement and e-tools should facilitate GPP. It is a considerable risk for GPP to be left outside the evolving development. Existing platforms for market communication are also important change agents and should at least include links to where information on GPP can be found.

There is a need for a dialogue between the environmental authorities and those responsible for PP on this and LCC. The *EU Green Paper on the Modernization of EU public procurement policy. Towards a more efficient European procurement market* opens up several possibilities for mainstreaming GPP in the longer run.

For instance the questions of making LCC compulsory would not only drive towards cost-efficiency, but also to greener purchasing decisions. Evident is at least that there is a need for more capacity building in LCC and that this would benefit from EU-level actions.

It is important to continue the work nationally with environmental communication in framework contracts, also since their role is increasing due to more centralization and co-operation of procurement. There is need for increased exchange of information between the Nordic countries on this.

Recommendations
- The SCP working group and each national authority should take the development of tools and templates for PP more into account and cooperate with the PP responsible ministries to increase mainstreaming
- The SCP working group should finance a Nordic LCC workshop for GPP and PP practitioners on policy level and for central change agents for GPP
- LCC should become an inherent part of criteria in Nordic and EU-level GPP toolkits. The SCP working group can promote this nationally and at EU-level
- The SCP working group could promote the communication of environmental criteria in framework contracts either by producing information on good examples or by developing methods on the basis of these examples
- The SCP working group should give input about environmental communication in framework contracts to the EU
• The SCP working group could consider putting into practice the recommendation in the report on framework agreement with risk sharing in the report *Innovative Green Public procurement of Construction, IT and Transport services in Nordic countries*

### 3.5 Capacity building

Capacity building is needed in both PP and GPP, especially at the local level. There is a need to develop an outreaching system for capacity building. The Norwegian system with regional “change agents” providing training closer to the procuring entities.

**Recommendations**

- The SCP working group could consider suggesting the development of an e-learning package including PP and GPP
- If EU-funding is received for the project of Baltic GPP, The SCP working group should also support the participating Nordic national focal points for GPP

### 3.6 Raising awareness on the use of the Eco labels

In the work of mainstreaming GPP it is important to besides developing the GPP criteria; also promote the communication of the use of Eco labels in public procurement.

**Recommendations**

- The ongoing project in the Nordic eco-labeling organizations on green public procurement should be closely followed by the SCP working group
4. Appendix 1
Scoping Mainstreaming – Denmark Points of investigation

4.1 Policy responsibility

4.1.1 Organisation(s) responsible at national level for

a) Development of PP
The Danish Competition Authority has the responsibility for maintaining and developing the legal framework for PP in accordance with the EU procurement directives. The Danish Competition Authority is an independent body of the Danish Competition and Consumer Authority. The Competition Authority is responsible for matters related to competition, energy regulation, public procurement and state aid.

The Authority is the secretariat of the Danish Competition Council and the Danish Energy Regulatory Authority. The Danish Competition Authority performs a number of tasks in cooperation with the competition authority of the European Commission, the Directorate General for Competition, and the other national competition authorities in the EU.

All public sectors in Denmark must purchase in compliance with the EU procurement directives.

Government/State
The Ministry of Finance is responsible for the governmental procurement policy. The purpose of the policy is to simplify and streamline governmental procurement. These requirements are explained in the Departmental Circular on Procurement.

The practical implementation of the governmental procurement policy is performed by the State Procurement (Statens Indkøb). State Procurement has been established by The Ministry of Finance and is located at

---

2 http://www.udbudsraadet.dk/.
3 http://www.statensindkob.dk/cirkulaerer.
Mainstreaming GPP in the Nordic countries

The Danish Economy Agency. State Procurement makes framework agreements that all governmental institutions are obliged to use. Regions and municipalities can choose to use of the governmental agreements.

Regions
The Association of the Danish Regions is coordinating the procurement strategy for the five regions in Denmark. They coordinate common projects, outsourcing, public-private-partnership and function as secretary for the network of the regional Procurement Officers. The regions have established a common procurement strategy.4

Municipalities
Local Government Denmark (LGDK) is coordinating the procurement strategy for the Danish municipalities. There has been established a joint procurement strategy for the municipalities.5 The strategy describes how the municipalities can optimise their procurement power and thereby obtain financial benefits.

b) Implementation and development of GPP
The Danish Ministry of the Environment has the overall responsibility for the Danish GPP policy. The ministry is focusing on the following areas:

- Intensified efforts to promote GPP within the following sectors: transportation, building and food
- Intensified efforts to promote GPP within the municipalities, since 2/3 of the public procurement budget is spend in the municipalities
- Intensified efforts to promote GPP in private companies
- Increase the knowledge about existing tools and advances of GPP and sustainable procurement

GPP/SRPP is an element of the governmental procurement strategy being implemented by State Procurement. The State Procurement is responsible for the implementation of this strategy.

The Danish Energy Agency has the overall responsibility for energy efficient procurement in governmental institution. The policy has been implemented in a Departmental Circular on Energy Efficiency.6 The Energy Agency has also entered voluntary agreement with Danish Region

---

and Local Government Denmark on energy efficient procurement within the regions and municipalities.\textsuperscript{7}

In 2008 The Danish Government published an action plan on corporate social responsibility (CSR). According to this action plan CSR should be implemented in all common procurement agreements, as stated in the conventions on which the principles of the UN Global Compact are based. Danish Government Centre for CSR at the Commerce and Companies Agency has the task of implementing the action plan.\textsuperscript{8}

Large businesses (businesses over a certain size) and governmental owned companies must report on CSR policies, strategies and actions in their annual business reports.\textsuperscript{9} The aim is to inspire businesses to take an active position on social responsibility and communicate this. The statutory requirement is part of the Government’s action plan for CSR and is intended to help improve the international competitiveness of Danish trade and industry.

The Danish Veterinary and Food Administration (DVFA) is part of the Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Fishery. DVFA guides public canteens and kitchens on how to provide organic meals. They have also developed an organic food label for canteens. Three variants of the label (gold, silver and bronze) exist depending on the percentage of organic food in the specific canteen.

Besides these national authorities the five regions have each their own PP policy and they all include GPP and SRPP. All 98 municipalities also have each their own PP policy and almost 90% includes GPP.\textsuperscript{10}

The mandates and funding arrangements of the organizations mentioned in 4.1.1

The governmental institutions and ministries mentioned above are all public financed and they have the mandate set out in relevant legislation. The budgets are being planed once a year.

The Association of the Danish Regions is financed by the regions and has the mandate is to negotiate on behalf of the regions and to coordinate and guide the regions in relation to e.g. procurement.

Local Government Denmark (LGDK) is financed by the Danish municipalities and has the mandate to negotiate on behalf of the municipalities and to coordinate and guide the municipalities in relation to e.g. procurement.

\textsuperscript{7} http://www.ens.dk/en-US/ConsumptionAndSavings/Public_Sector/regional_and_local/Sider/Forside.aspx.
\textsuperscript{8} http://www.csrgov.dk/sw49167.asp.
\textsuperscript{9} Further information on the legislation may be found here: http://www.csrgov.dk/sw51190.asp.
4.1.2 *Forms of co-operation between the above mentioned organizations in relation to PP and GPP*

All of the above mentioned organizations are co-operating at least to a certain level. E.g. the Danish EPA and the Danish Energy Agency gives input to environmental and energy requirements and criteria in the common governmental agreements. But the agreements are developed by the State Procurement and they have the final say on the agreements.

In some of the Danish municipalities a link has been established between the environmental department and the procurement department. The environmental department contributes with input on GPP during the whole tender process; from defining relevant requirements to evaluation of tender bids.

4.2 Competence

4.2.1 *Organizations providing training in PP (Name, type of organization, funding, geographical spread)*

- Center for Public Competence Development (Center for Offentlig Kompetence Udvikling) organizes courses and training on procurement, E-procurement and procurement legislation. Further information (only in Danish): www.cok.dk/om-cok
- IKA – The Association of Public Procurement Officers in Denmark – offers training in PP. Further information at their homepage: www.ika.dk/index.php?id=4
- DILF (Danish Purchasing and Logistics Forum) offers training and seminars on PP and sometimes also on CSR and responsible supply chain management. A list of actual seminars may be found at their homepage: http://www.dilf.dk/dk/arrangementer/
- SKI (National Procurement Ldt. Denmark) offers some courses in procurement, http://www.ski.dk/Aktuelt/arrangementer/Sider/default.aspx SKI is a public owned private company providing framework agreements that can be used by the public sector on a voluntary basis and most courses are about the use of SKI contracts

Many private companies (e.g. lawyers) provide courses and training in procurement. The largest private provider of training in PP is Nohr-Con. Nohr-Con organizes more than a hundred events a year in Denmark, Norway, Sweden and Germany. They are specialized in offering courses and conferences about Procurement and Construction. They organize a number of courses on procurement law and construction law. Contact information may be found at their homepage: www.nohr-con.com.
4.2.2  Organizations providing training in GPP (Name, type of organization, funding, geographical spread)

Different organizations like Green Network, Key2Green, SKI and IKA and also the Danish EPA – do from time to time offer training in GPP. For the time being there are no courses or training in GPP planned. In 2010 there were some training on GPP arranged by The Ministry of the Environment and the Partnership for Green Procurement e.g. on legal and sustainable timber. Further information here:

- http://www.gronneindkob.dk/. A lot of training is offered within different procurement network – see below.

4.2.3  E-learning available for PP and GPP

The Danish Center for Energy Savings has developed several e-tool and e-guidelines and a film introducing all the tools and guidelines which can be downloaded at their homepage:

- http://www.goenergi.dk/offentlig/til-dig-som-er/indkoebsansvarlig

4.3  Support functions (name, function, funding and responsible organization)

4.3.1  Existing networks for PP and GPP respectively

Different PP and GPP networks exist in Denmark. Below is a list of the most important network:

- IKA is holding several different networks on PP. At their homepage is a list of the networks: http://www.ika.dk/index.php?id=5
- KL (The Association of Municipalities) holds a tender-network: http://www.udbudsportalen.dk/Om-portalen/Udbudsportalens-Udbudsnetvark/.
- SKI’s runs the following networks
  - Three networks for purchasers in the municipalities (geographically spread)
  - One for the governmental purchasers (SKIF)
  - One GPP network
  - One it-network for digitization
Within these networks (apart from the IT-network) GPP and SRPP has been a topic and the participants have received training in GPP. Further information here:


The following PP networks are for municipalities developing common framework agreements:

- Aalborg modellen
- Jysk Fællesindkøb
- Fællesindkøb Fyn
- Vestegnens indkøbsforum
- 12 by-gruppen
- Indkøbsfællesskab Nordsjælland
- Indkøbsfællesskab – region Sjælland
- Aalborg-modellen
- Limfjord Vest
- Region Sjælland
- Sydjysk Kommuneindkøb.
- Spar 5


The Danish EPA has a partnership on GPP with 6 municipalities – [http://www.gronneindkob.dk/](http://www.gronneindkob.dk/) this partnership also has the function of a network for the participating partners.

The Center for Energy Saving runs a network for municipalities that have committed themselves to binding reductions of their energy consumptions. More than 70 out of 98 municipalities take part in this network.

4.3.2 Existing helpdesks and consultancy services for PP and GPP

The Danish Competition Authority has a hotline on legal issues related to PP and GPP:

- [http://www.konkurrencestyrelsen.dk/service-menu/kontakt/](http://www.konkurrencestyrelsen.dk/service-menu/kontakt/).

Questions related to GPP would normally being forwarded to the Danish EPA, SKI or the Partnership for Green Procurement.
4.3.3 Availability of online advice, information, handbooks

The Tender Portal gathers all information on PP. The target group is the municipalities. However, most of the information at the site is also relevant to the regions and state institutions:

- http://www.udbudsportalen.dk

4.3.4 Available tools for PP and GPP (e.g. eProcurement)

- The Danish EPA homepage on GPP: http://www.mst.dk/Virksomhed-_og_myndighed/Industri/baeredygtige_indkoeb.
- Guideline on legal and sustainable timber: http://www.naturstyrelsen.dk/Naturbeskyttelse/Skov/Miljoet/vejledning/
- GPP guidelines: www.miljoevejledninger.dk
- GPP EU tender tool: http://www.gronindkobsportal.dk/Default.asp?ID=184
- Center for Energy Savings – guidelines on energy efficient procurement: http://www.goenergi.dk/offentlig

Cost efficiency

There is a Danish report on methods for national economy, guidance and an excel file included Samfundsøkonomiske gevinster og omkostninger ved grønne produkter. The Environment Agency is planning to develop a guide on how the method can be used in public procurement.

Total cost calculator:

- http://www.goenergi.dk/offentlig/til-dig-som-er/indkoebansvarlig/
  Totalprisberegner1

4.3.5 Standard templates available (PINs, criteria, contracts etc.)

IKA standard templates:

- Standard contracts may be downloaded at: http://www.udbudsportalen.dk/Ret-og-regler/Standardkontrakter/
Standard social clauses may be downloaded at:


Standard PINs:


4.3.6 Existing platforms for public authorities market communication

All EU call for tenders are published on at least one of the following web-pages:

- http://udbudsvagten.dk
- www.udbudavisen.dk
- www.regionsudbud.dk
- www.digitaleklynger.dk

4.3.7 Availability of funding for public authorities’ development of procurement (funding organization, object, timeframe)

The ABT (Citizen Applied Technology) Trust finances projects on how to use technology in a new way the public sector.11 Funding through Danish Ministry for the Environment:

- Innovative GPP. Action plan under the Danish Ministry for the Environment. 5 mio. DKK has been earmarked projects related to the action plan, http://www.mst.dk/Virksomhed_og_myndighed/Industri/baeredygtige_indkoeb/udvalgte_projekter_baeredygtige_indkoeb/offentlig_efterspoergsel_nye_innovative_loesninger/
- Forum for Sustainable Procurement. 1,8 mio. DKK Funding activities contribute to promote GPP in both public and private companies

---

11 http://www.abtfonden.dk/Om_Fonden.aspx.
4.4 Procurement management

4.4.1 PP and GPP as part of strategies, rules and regulations for public bodies

**PP**
All public bodies most follow the Danish procurement law (that implements the EU procurement directives). An overview of the rules may be found here: www.konkurrencestyrelsen.dk/en/procurement/legislation/.

Governmental institutions most follow the departmental circulars on PP.¹

Regions and municipalities are of course autonomous but are expected to follow strategies decided by respectively Danish Regions and Local Government Denmark.

**GPP**
Governmental institutions must use the mandatory framework agreement. GPP is implemented in the agreement.

The Danish regions have a voluntary agreement on energy efficiency and energy efficient procurement⁷.

The Danish municipalities have a voluntary agreement on energy efficiency and energy efficient procurement⁷.

SKI has published an overview of the municipalities voluntary initiatives related to GPP – it may be downloaded here:


4.4.2 Auditing and enforcement of PP and GPP (who and how)
The Ministry of Finance is enforcing the governmental PP strategy and policy.

4.4.3 Monitoring of PP and GPP (who and how)
All ministries must report to The Ministry of Finance/State Procurement about their purchases.

The Audit of the State Account does from time to time examine whether the governmental institutions are efficient when buying goods and services.

Monitoring of GPP is ad hoc but during the last 15 year several national surveys on GPP have been carried out.
4.4.4 Current and foreseen development of PP (subject areas, tools, organization etc.)

Currently, an increased focus is on Public Private Partnership (the government has set specific targets for tender of public tasks), Public Private Innovation and easier access for SMV to public contracts.

4.4.5 Current and foreseen development of GPP (subject areas, tools, organization etc.)

The GPP focus areas are:

- Intensified efforts to promote GPP within the following sectors: transportation, building and food
- Intensified efforts to promote GPP within the municipalities, since 2/3 of the public procurement budget is spend in the municipalities
- Intensified efforts to promote GPP in private companies
- Spreading knowledge about existing tools and advances of GPP and sustainable procurement
5. Appendix 2
Scoping mainstreaming – Norway

5.1 Policy responsibility

5.1.1 Organization(s) responsible at national level for

a) Development of PP
The responsibility for increasing the quality of public procurement in Norway lies in each organization that carries out procurement. The PP law\(^\text{12}\) and regulations\(^\text{13}\) specify a clear and somewhat rigid framework which procurements have to follow. Norwegian PP laws are based on EU directives, but include more stringent environmental requirements to both planning and specifying the procurement.

The responsibility for maintaining and developing the legal framework for PP lies with the Ministry of Government Administration, Reform and Church Affairs.\(^\text{14}\) The ministry has the right to update regulations after following a standard consultation procedure (utredningsinstruksen\(^\text{15}\)). The ministry can also propose changes in the law, (after a consultation process), but changes in the law must be made by the parliament. The ministry has close contact with DG-Market in order to ensure PP-compatibility with the EU.

The ministry runs and funds (most of) the Agency for Public Management and eGovernment (Difi)\(^\text{16}\) which has a PP department whose goal is to make public procurement more effective. At present, the department’s main priorities are:

a) Increasing the use of ICT in public procurement – in particular eTrade, eInvoicing and international eTrade (about 12 persons)

\(^{12}\) http://www.lovdata.no/all/hi-19990716-069.html.
\(^{13}\) http://www.lovdata.no/for/sf/sf-19990716-069.html.
b) Increasing procurement competence in the field, mainly through an internet site\(^{17}\), conferences and courses. (3 persons)

C) Collecting PP-statistics (1 person)

d) Providing input to the ministry for developing PP policies.

\*\*\*\*\*

b) Implementation and development of GPP

As mentioned above, the PP law specifies that procurers should always take environmental aspects into account when planning procurement, and that for procurements over 500,000 NOK (ca. €60,000) the PP regulation requires that lifecycle and environmental aspects should be included in the requirements in the competition documents. As such, it is up to each procuring organization to ensure that their organization follows the PP-regulations.

However, since this requirement is somewhat open ended, 3 ministries (Environment, Government administration and Family affairs) developed in 2007 the National Action Plan for Environmental and social responsibility in Public Procurement (NAP).\(^{18}\) The NAP requires all national governmental organizations to have an environmental management system and to apply an environmental policy in their procurement. The NAP identifies prioritized product areas and associated environmental challenges and announces the development of standard environmental criteria. The NAP also urges local authorities to take environmental consideration in their procurement.

The NAP has been adopted by the previous government and referred to in two parliamentary whitepapers without arousing political controversy. As such it is accepted as binding on national government organizations. Local authorities are of course autonomous.

Responsibility for following up the NAP has been placed in Difis PP-department (mentioned above). Earmarked funding from the Ministries of Environment, Family affairs, Business and trade and Agriculture finances, respectively, environmental, social, innovative and food activities.

Focal points for GPP “Knutepunkter” have been established in each county and for national government organizations to motivate and support procurers in their region in implementing environmental aspects in their procurement. The focal points are functions that have been placed in existing PP networks so as to be able to reuse existing channels as much as possible. Each knutepunkt is steerd by a management board established by the County Governor (who represents the national government at the county level) and comprising representatives from public organizations and local suppliers.

\(^{17}\) http://www.anskaffelser.no.

### The mandates and funding arrangements of the organizations mentioned in 1.1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organisation</th>
<th>Mandate</th>
<th>Funding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Government Administration (MoGA)</td>
<td>Develop policy and legal framework for more effective PP</td>
<td>Annual national budget approved by parliament</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Environment (MoE)</td>
<td>Achieve environmental goals by i.e. using environmental criteria in PP to make public procurement</td>
<td>Annual national budget approved by parliament (about 4 posts centrally and 18 for the county network)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Trade and Industry</td>
<td>Ensure that PP opens for and motivates for innovation</td>
<td>Small ad-hoc contribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Children and Equality</td>
<td>Ensure that social aspects are included in PP (ILO core conventions)</td>
<td>1–2 posts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Norwegian Agricultural Authority</td>
<td>Using PP to increase sales of organic food</td>
<td>1 post</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agency for Public Management and eGovernment (Difi)</td>
<td>From MoGA: Develop and distribute tools (eTrade in particular) Run training for making procurement more effective Run internet sites for public procurers and suppliers (tools, information and support for procurement and purchasing) Provide input for policy development. Collect and analyse statistics From MoE: Promote, support and monitor environmental management in national state organizations Follow up Develop and distribute recommended environmental criteria for procurement Develop and distribute tools to support G in PP Run training courses Spread relevant information and tools on the internet Monitor progress (statistics) Manage the focal points From Ministries of Family, Business and Agriculture: Similar activities as the above but focusing on achieving their political goals</td>
<td>Annual disbursement from ministry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focal points</td>
<td>From MoE via County management board appointed by the County Governor</td>
<td>Annual disbursement from Difi (€80,000 per focal point)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private training providers</td>
<td>Hold courses approved by Difi</td>
<td>Participant contribution</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 5.1.2 Forms of co-operation between the above mentioned organizations

The Ministries steer Difi’s activities through the normal budget planning and follow up system. This implies that Difi suggests activities for the next year (as well as major activities for the year after that) and in January / February gets a letter instructing Difi what it will do (“tildelingsbrevet”). Follow up takes place 3 times a year based on written report and meeting.

When the Ministries request Difi to provide input to or participate in policy development processes, the collaboration is closer and adapted to the particular activity.
Within Difi, the PP-department is divided into 3 teams: eTrade, procurement competence and Environmental and social responsibility. The former two being part of Difi’s “normal” funding, whilst the latter collects funds from the “other” ministries. The department director, in collaboration with the team leaders, has the responsibility of maximizing synergy between the teams (i.e. mainstreaming GPP). Difi was only established in 2008 and each of these teams has been built up quickly, so that focus has often been on the team’s main goals.

Collaboration with the focal points (see description above under 5.1.1) is more challenging due to a) geographical distance, b) diverse needs in the different counties and c) the fact that they have their own steering groups and are employed locally (in existing procurement organizations) and thereby are not under Difi control. Difi provides support and has allocated specific persons in Oslo as liaison for the focal points and these take part in planning and concrete activities, like conferences at the county level, so as to try to maximize communication and trust between Difi and each focal point. The focal points for central government and the Oslo area are physically located in Difi.

5.2 Competence

b) Organizations providing training in PP (Name, type of organization, funding, geographical spread)

NIMA (Norwegian association for procurement and logistics) and KS (the Norwegian Association of Local and Regional Authorities) both organize training courses in Public Procurement. Both give certificates – NIMA’s based on an exam, whilst KS’ is based on participation (3 2-day courses). These courses are available in Oslo. Some local authorities (e.g. Oslo) arrange similar certification internally.

Difi also coordinates a wide range of courses19 on PP held by external consultants. The courses are spread across the country. All Difi courses are financed by participants.

Difi is exploring the possibility of establishing a national certification scheme for public procurers, including examination in a pilot project with a major public procurer.

---

c) Organizations providing training in GPP (Name, type of organization, funding, geographical spread)

The county focal points have been organizing GPP training for procurers in their county. These courses are funded from Difi via the support given to the focal points.

e) E-learning available for PP and GPP

No e-learning is available, although we have considered translating the Swedish GPP e-learning module:


5.3 Support functions (Name, function, funding and responsible organization)

e) Existing networks for PP and GPP respectively

PP networks

A report from First Ventura in 2007\(^{20}\) identified over 80 public procurement networks. Many of these link local authorities. Some of these are active in procurement processes – both awarding contracts and coordinating buying.

There is also a procurement network linking all the counties for coordination and information exchange.

GPP networks

The GPP networks are based on the focal points – which are placed in existing PP networks – one for each county plus one for national institutions:

- Existing helpdesks and consultancy services for PP and GPP

KS runs an advisory PP service for their members (local authorities) as part of their legal services. The first hour is free and after that they have to pay.

Difi does not participate in specific procurements but can answer procurement related questions in general terms (but not assist in concrete procurement cases) – both PP and GPP.

- Availability of online advice, information, handbooks

www.anskaffelser.no provides a central repository/gateway. Over 9000 unique visitors in November 2010 made over 15000 visits.

- Available tools for PP and GPP (e.g. eProcurement)

**PP:**
- Many templates (see below)
- E-Trading platform
- Competition Execution Tool (Verktøy for Konkurransegjennomføring – KGV)

**GPP:**
- Criteria sets for major product groups
- Green and social supply chains: simple reporting system
- Risk analysis tool for identifying high risk product areas (both environmentally and socially)

**Cost efficiency:**
- Examples of economic analyses:
  - http://www.sfso.no/templates/Page___6524.aspx
- Handbook for analyses in national economy:
  - http://www.sfso.no/templates/Page___6523.aspx
- LCC for buildings (early planning):
  - http://tidliglcc.difi.no/
- Calculation tool for net present value:
  - http://www.greennow.net/innkjop/evalueringsverktøy.htm

Standard templates available (PINs, criteria, contracts etc.)

**PP:**
- Standard contracts for ICT development and consultants
- Existing platforms for public authorities market communication

Doffin: all PP RFTs over 500 000 NOK have to be published here. Other RFTs can be (voluntary). Ol-nyheter/ehandel.no
Anskaffelser.no

---

• Availability of funding for public authorities’ development of procurement (funding organization, object, timeframe)

Funding through Innovation Norway for procurement that involves development of new products. (Public Reasearch and Development contracts – OFU – Offentlige forsknings- og utviklingskontrakter), as well as Framtidens Byer (ad hoc).

5.4 Procurement management

a) PP and GPP as part of strategies, rules and regulations for public bodies

Environmental requirements are specified in the law and regulations for PP: In the law for the planning phase (all procurement) and in the regulation for the competition documents for contracts over 500 000 NOK.

All state organizations are required to have environmental management systems and environmental criteria in procurement is required to be part of the system. They are also required by the NAP to include environmental criteria for about 10 prioritized product groups.

The local authorities are requested to do the same with respect to procurement (but as the NAP is a national government document it can only request local government, whereas it can instruct national organizations).

b) Auditing and enforcement of PP and GPP (who and how)

PP: So far, most of the PP audit for national institutions has been carried out by the Office of the Auditor General (reporting directly to the Parliament) and have indicated that significant improvement is possible. The local authorities are audited by their own auditors.

KOFA – Norwegian Complaints Board for PP is an independent national board that can handle 1) appeals for wrongful awards by companies that were part of the competition but did not win the contract and 2) complaints from companies and branch organizations in the case of non-publishing of competitions that should have been published (i.e. illegal direct award of contracts). In case 2, KOFA can fine the public agency.

c) Monitoring of PP and GPP (who and how)

Monitoring of GPP and PP is at present ad hoc. The latest monitoring of GPP was published in February 2010 (Difi contract) based on stochastic analysis of tenders from Doffin (the publishing database for PP).

d) Current and foreseen development of PP (subject areas, tools, organization etc.)

The main emphasis at present is on increased use of electronic procurement tools in order to:
• Increase process quality (automation and use of templates and examples)
• Increase effectiveness (less manual work)
• Increase openness (more documentation online)
• Reduce costs of monitoring/audit (collection of statistics integrated in system)

e) Current and foreseen development of GPP (subject areas, tools, organization etc.)
The following trends characterize our view on GPP development:

• Strong focus on integrating GPP into PP
• Acceptance that PP will be increasing ePP, so that the G in GPP has to be reflected in the eTools that will be used in PP. The challenge is that this means we have to find how to pack environmental information into the formats that ePP will be using (like electronic product catalogues). This trend will affect the procurement of small goods (PCs, paper, nappies, etc).
• GPP focus is moving from focus on individual items (see point above) to the whole procurement process for complex items. Examples are:
  • whether to have in-house computer centers or buy green IT capacity externally or
  • How to organize an office procurement (rental) so as to get the most effective offer AND how to follow this up after the contract has been achieved.
  • how to organize a building process so as to get a willingness to invest in energy efficiency (higher building cost) so as to achieve a long term cost benefit
• We need to give procurers tools, not just knowledge
• We need more focus on monitoring: are they using the right criteria, are they influencing which products are being bought, what they influencing product development, what are the environmental and financial effects (both short and long term)?
6. Appendix 3
Scoping mainstreaming – Iceland

6.1 1. Policy responsibility

6.1.1 Organisation(s) responsible at national level for

- Development of PP
  The Ministry of Finance is responsible for the government procurement policy and for the legislative framework.
- Implementation and development of GPP
  Ministry of Finance and the Ministry for the Environment

6.1.2 The mandates and funding arrangements of the organizations mentioned in 1.1.

6.1.3 Forms of co-operation between the above mentioned organizations

6.2 Competence

6.2.1 Organizations providing training in PP (Name, type of organization, funding, geographical spread)

Rikiskaup – The State Trading Centre, The State Trading Centre (Ríkiskaup) operates under the auspices of the Ministry of Finance. Ríkiskaup is self funded and employees are around 23 in various position. The role of the State Trading Centre (Ríkiskaup) is to handle procurement on supplies and services in domestic and foreign markets for state institutions and state corporations. The Centre examines joint needs for supplies and services and endeavours to co-ordinate procurement through framework agreements. The Centre also provides commercial assistance and instructions concerning individual procurement as needed. The Centre gives consultation, handles selling and purchasing of state property and collects information about the procurement needs of the state institutions and state corporations.
6.2.2 Organizations providing training in GPP (Name, type of organization, funding, geographical spread)

Rikiskaup, (as above) and the Environment Agency of Iceland. The Environment Agency operates under the direction of the Ministry for the Environment. Its role is to promote the protection as well as sustainable use of Iceland’s natural resources, as well as public welfare by helping to ensure a healthy environment, and safe consumer goods.

6.2.3 E-learning available for PP and GPP

- www.vinn.is, www.rikiskaup.is

6.3 Support functions (Name, function, funding and responsible organization)

6.3.1 Existing networks for PP and GPP respectively

None

6.3.2 Existing helpdesks and consultancy services for PP and GPP

None

6.3.3 Availability of online advice, information, handbooks

See above

6.3.4 Available tools for PP and GPP (e.g. eProcurement)

Not applicable

6.3.5 Standard templates available (PINs, criteria, contracts etc.)

Rikiskaup provides.

6.3.6 Existing platforms for public authorities market communication

Not available.
6.3.7 Availability of funding for public authorities’ development of procurement (funding organization, object, timeframe)

Not available

6.4 Procurement management

6.4.1 PP and GPP as part of strategies, rules and regulations for public bodies

6.4.2 Auditing and enforcement of PP and GPP (who and how)

6.4.3 Monitoring of PP and GPP (who and how)

6.4.4 Current and foreseen development of PP (subject areas, tools, organization etc.)

6.4.5 Current and foreseen development of GPP (subject areas, tools, organization etc.)

The Government of Iceland approved a Procurement Policy of the State in 2002 and urged institutions to take environmental issues as well as costs and quality into consideration in procurement.

In 2009 the Government adopted the Government Policy for Ecological Procurement, which shall be implemented through the Action Plan for Ecological Public Procurement 2009-2012 – GPP NAP (Stefna um vistven innkaup ríkisins).

Ministry of the Environment (Umhverfisráðuneytið) and Ministry of Finance (Fjármálaráðuneytið).

To facilitate implementation a steering group for ecological public procurement (with representatives from Ministry for the Environment, Finance Ministry, State Trading Centre (Rikiskaup) and local communities) and a working group on GPP for the State (with representatives from the Finance Ministry and the Ministry for the Environment) were established in 2009.
7. Appendix 4
Scoping Mainstreaming – Sweden

7.1 1. Policy responsibility

7.1.1 Organisation(s) responsible at national level for

a) Development of PP
There are two organizations responsible for the development of PP at national level, the Legal, Financial, and Administrative Services Agency and the Swedish Competition Authority. The Legal, Financial, and Administrative Services Agency is responsible for a national function for procurement assistance and development. The function has three main objectives:

- to provide practical guidance and support to both public sector, contracting authorities and businesses regarding public procurement.
- to promote and accelerate the use of electronic procurement in Sweden and participate in the common European initiatives and standardization projects on this topic;
- to develop and manage a national database for procurement notices for contracts applying to the Act on System of Choice in the Public Sector.

The Swedish Competition Authority is responsible for information on and supervision of Public Procurement.

The responsibility for maintaining and developing the legal framework for PP lies with the Ministry of Health and Social Affairs.

b) Implementation and development of GPP
The Swedish Environmental Protection Agency \(\text{-SEPA}\) is the national agency for environmental protection and nature conservation. Its key tasks are to present proposals for environmental policy and legislation to the Swedish Government and ensure that environmental policy decisions are implemented.

The Swedish EPA has the responsibility to monitor and evaluate the greening of public procurement by means of qualitative and quantitative
Mainstreaming GPP in the Nordic countries

studies. The results of the studies are used of the Swedish EPA as a basis when proposing development of new measures and updates of the Swedish National Action Plan for GPP.

Every two-three years a questionnaire survey is carried out among those responsible for procurement in central government, municipalities and county councils. The response level is usually around 80 per cent. To ensure a high response level, the questionnaires are of a general nature, without too much detail.

In addition, some 300 procurement processes in various product areas are audited every three years, which gives us an idea of the requirements specified in procurement processes. The results show whether environmental requirements have been specified, and how they have been expressed.

**SEPA is also representing the government internationally.**

The Environment Ministry is responsible for GPP on the governmental level. The Swedish Government has endorsed a three-year National Action Plan (NAP) for Green Public Procurement (GPP) 2007–2009. The action plan sets out current status, targets and proposed measures to achieve the goals.

**Targets:**
- The proportion of public bodies that regularly stipulate environmental requirements shall increase
- The proportion of government framework agreements containing properly formulated environmental requirements having an impact on product and services shall increase
- Set national targets for public consumption
- Tighten control of government agencies
- Involve local politicians and leaders
- Ensure the requisite skill among purchasers
- Offer an efficient and simple purchasing tool

Operational responsibility for implementing the National Action Plan is rested on the Swedish Environment Management Council (SEMCo), which accordingly is the key actor for implementing development within the area of GPP. The role of SEMCo is equivalent of an expert authority to which purchasers can contact for advice on how to include environmental requirements in their tender documents. It is important that SEMCo carefully monitor development of GPP and its positive effects, in order to be able to function as the best source of support for purchasers in the long term. SEMCo should also be able to offer support to private purchasers, e.g. through training courses.

SEMCo, under the direction of the Government Offices, represents Sweden in EU cooperation and in international collaboration on variety of aspects related to GPP.
SEPA has proposed a new NAP on GPP for the next three years and is currently under consideration in the Governmental office. As a result of the Energy Service Directive, the Energy Agency has the assignment to coordinate the energy efficient measures, including GPP, that the public sector ought to implement. SEMCo has an assignment from the Energy Agency on the parts concerning GPP. This assignment includes support, training and other information on the procurement of energy efficient products. The Ministry for Rural Affairs has assigned SEMCo to provide help to food related procurements – i.e. education, information and coordinating function among relevant authorities and stakeholders.

7.1.2 The mandates and funding arrangements of the organizations mentioned in 1.1.

For mandates, see text above. The above mentioned Agencies are funded by central government, and are independent authorities acting on the basis of a government ordinance that defines its terms of reference. SEMCo get funds from the Environment Ministry for the role as key actor in performing the NAP.

7.1.3 Forms of co-operation between the above mentioned organizations

Is done by regular communication, meetings and by taking part in different working groups set up by these organizations.

7.2 Competence

7.2.1 Organizations providing training in PP (Name, type of organization, funding, geographical spread)

Training is done by the private sector in Sweden, i.e. consultant companies (e.g. Opic, Allego, SILF), and by some universities (e.g. Stockholm University, Uppsala University).

7.2.2 Organizations providing training in GPP (Name, type of organization, funding, geographical spread)

SEMCo (see above) and consultant companies (GoodPoint, Ecoplan, Yggrasil, Sustainia)
7.2.3 **E-learning available for PP and GPP**
SEMCo has a web-based education concerning GPP and climate efficient procurement.

7.3 **Support functions (Name, function, funding and responsible organization)**

7.3.1 **Existing networks for PP and GPP respectively**
SOI – Network of Swedish public procurers, SILF Competence AB has a network for purchasers. SEMCo arranged meetings for State frame-work agreements procurers (governmental frame-work agreements are concentrated in a new organization from 1 Jan 2011 in the Legal, Financial, and Administrative Services Agency).

7.3.2 **Existing helpdesks and consultancy services for PP and GPP**
SEMCo have a helpdesk concerning GPP. The Legal, Financial, and Administrative Services Agency are about to build up a helpdesk for PP.

7.3.3 **Availability of online advice, information, handbooks**
The Legal, Financial, and Administrative Services Agency as well as the Swedish Competition Authority have online advice, information and handbooks concerning PP. SEMCo provide this information on GPP.

7.3.4 **Available tools for PP and GPP (e.g. eProcurement)**
Se text above

7.3.5 **Standard templates available (PINs, criteria, contracts etc.)**
SEMCo provides guidelines and criteria for GPP. The Legal, Financial, and Administrative Services Agency has developed templates for tender documents, tender evaluation, electronic auctions, work contracts for buildings etc. The competition Authority has developed a legal guide on GPP.
7.3.6 Existing platforms for public authorities market communication

In Sweden private companies provide databases for publication of PP notices, examples are:

- Allego
- E-avrop
- Eniro upphandling
- Licitio
- Mercell
- OPIC

7.3.7 Availability of funding for public authorities’ development of procurement (funding organization, object, timeframe)

No information on that.

7.4 Procurement management

7.4.1 PP and GPP as part of strategies, rules and regulations for public bodies

Environmental requirements are specified in the Public Procurement Act. Last summer was a legislative amendment in Sweden which says that the authorities, if warranted, should take environmental and social considerations in public procurement, as opposed to the word “can” as it used to be formulated in the old version of the procurement law. For further information, see information about the NAP above.

7.4.2 Auditing and enforcement of PP and GPP (who and how) Monitoring of PP and GPP (who and how)

The Swedish EPA has the responsibility of monitoring the greening of public procurement by means of qualitative and quantitative studies, see above for more information.

The Swedish Competition Authority should actively promote an efficient public procurement. They are responsible of supervision of public procurement.

The Competition Authority:
- give priority to enforcement activities, with special attention to violations of rules of greater importance or of certain principle concern
- report whether there are laws that counteract efficient public procurement
- monitor and report on legal developments in public procurement both nationally and internationally

They also provide information on public procurement in order to prevent rule violations. They work towards a uniform application of national procurement rules.

### 7.4.3 Current and foreseen development of PP (subject areas, tools, organization etc.) Current and foreseen development of GPP (subject areas, tools, organization etc.)

A Swedish governmental investigation is currently evaluating the procurement regulations. The aim is to make public procurement more efficient and to improve public procurement, including GPP/SPP.

In a State investigation it is proposed that all help provided by the state to PP should be organized in one state agency. Decision will probably come during spring 2011 from the government. Attachment 5
8. Appendix 5
Scoping Mainstreaming – Finland

8.1 Policy responsibility

8.1.1 Organisation(s) responsible at national level for

a) Development of PP
a) The Ministry of Finance:

- state budget
- responsibility for implementing the Government procurement Strategy
- Government procurement Handbook

b) The Ministry of Trade and Employment:

- Implementation and enforcement of the national public procurement law
- The law on e-procurement and a dynamic procurement system
- The Strategy for Climate change and energy efficiency
- The national innovation policy and the Action Plan for user and demand driven innovation policy
- The strategic wood policy

c) The Association of Municipalities:

- Public procurement advisory unit funded by the Ministry of Employment and Trade gives legal advice concerning PP,
- Procurement handbook for Municipalities

d) The State Treasury is a quality-managed service agency under the Ministry of Finance:

- The Government IT Shared Service Centre. The Government IT Shared Service Centre uses shared government IT services to support the trans-administrative operation of administrative sectors and agencies
- E-procurement tools, TILHA: an electronic database for purchasing of products and services. TILHA makes billing more effective, enhances the use of framework agreements and facilitates a more comprehensive public procurement reporting.

f) Hansel Ltd:

- Government framework agreements, contracting, development of the framework agreement system.

**b) Implementation and development of GPP**

a) The Environment Ministry is responsible for the Finnish Action Plan as a whole and its follow up.

b) The Ministry of Employment and Trade responsible for the implementation of the Energy Service Directive and energy efficient public procurement. Also, responsible for the innovation policy and the implementation of the demand driven innovation policy action plan.

c) Motiva Oy, runs the public environmental technologies helpdesk as set out in the NAP, promotes energy efficient public procurement according to ESD and participates in the EU Lead Market funded SCI Network project.

The environmental technology procurement helpdesk is in its third year and has been funded by the Ministry of Employment and Trade, The National Innovation Fund SITRA and the Ministry of the Environment.

Motiva’s work on energy efficient PP is funded by the Ministry of Employment and Trade.

d) The Finnish Environment Institute: Participates in the “Unofficial GPP Advisory Group” of EU on behalf of the Environment Ministry. Has published Environmental Guide about GPP, and has given education about GPP at the general courses for state procurers since 2004. Organized training of Hansel Ltd for GPP and accounting for environmental aspects in state framework contracts. Has conducted several research projects on GPP, funded by e.g. EU commission and Academy of Finland.

e) The Regional authority for central Finland administers the Environmental Pass for professional kitchens as laid down in the NAP. The development of this has been funded by the MTT Agrifood Research Finland under the Ministry of Agriculture.
8.1.2 The mandates and funding arrangements of the organizations mentioned in 1.1.

See point 1.1. above.

8.1.3 Forms of co-operation between the above mentioned organizations

The organizations participated in the working group for the national action plan on GPP.

This resulted in that the Finnish Government passed a resolution that encourages all public actors to adopt sustainable procurement and sets targets for specific product and service groups.

Discussions between the different Ministries about GPP have intensified during the last year and there is a will to develop the synergies between different policies. In practice this means involving other ministries in the own policy development.

The Ministry of Finance is planning to launch an annual procurement day for government purchasing entities. GPP is one aspect that will be on the agenda.

Valtion hankintaverkosto. On the initiative of HAUS an informal network for government purchasing entities has been set up. This provides for a forum for discussion around different aspects around PP. Motiva participates in the network.

The Advisory Unit on PP and Motiva co-operate on the operational level in their respective help desk functions and information dissemination and capacity building.

8.2 Capacity building

8.2.1 Organizations providing training in PP (Name, type of organization, funding, geographical spread)

- HAUS development agency. State owned company, in house organization. Training fee. Operates in Helsinki
- LOGY. Finnish Association of Purchasing and Logistics. The association has 3600 individual members and approximately 250 corporate members. It has 12 districts. The purpose of the Finnish Association of Purchasing and Logistics (LOGY) is to develop procedures for purchasing of materials and services and to promote physical logistics (i.e. transport, storage, handling) and the professional skills of employees in logistics for the benefit of the Finnish economy and society
Chambers of commerce as well as the Enterprise Academy (Yritysakatemia) offer training for both companies on how to tender and become a good supplier to the public sector.

Several law firms around the country, i.e. PTC Services, specialized in PP.

8.2.2 Organizations providing training in GPP (Name, type of organization, funding, geographical spread)

- Finnish Consulting Group, consultancy firm partly owned by the Association of Municipalities. FCG operates as a private firm.
- Has offices in several cities in Finland, however GPP training usually around the Helsinki metropolitan area.
- HAUS development agency. State owned company, in house organization. Training fee. Operates in Helsinki. Approximately one training day per 6 months relating to GPP.
- The Chamber of Commerce in Helsinki.
- Regional competence centers usually within the framework of an ongoing project, often EAKR-funded.
- Several law firms around the country.

8.2.3 E-learning available for PP and GPP

- a) Environmental pass for professional kitchens (Ympäristöpassi), provides web based training and the Environmental Pass Diploma. The website is currently being piloted and therefore not accessible.
- b) Julkisten hankintojen ympäristöopas was developed by the Finnish Environment Institute and is available at http://www.ymparisto.fi/default.asp?contentid=325353&lan=FI

The net site of state environmental administration:


8.3 Support functions (name, function, funding and responsible organization)

8.3.1 Existing networks for PP and GPP respectively

Hansel Ltd. (in 1.1.)

KL Kuntahankinnat Oy is a company, partly owned by the Association of Municipalities. They make framework contracts for municipalities. Kuntahankinnat was founded in 2009.
There are a number of regional procurement co-operation networks in Finland. The ambitions are to co-ordinate procurement activities and make joint framework agreements.

There is no association for public purchasers in Finland. More informal networks have been established: government procurement network, network between the procurement directors of the biggest cities. The Finnish Association of Purchasing and Logistics also has members from the public sector, but deals with sourcing in general.

There is also a network of frontrunner cities in innovation.

There is an informal network for GPP. They meet about once a year. Leadership is circulated among the participants. The activity between the meetings is scarce.

8.3.2 Existing helpdesks and consultancy services for PP and GPP

a) The Public Procurement Advisory Unit is a joint project of the Ministry of Employment and Economy and the Association of Finnish Local and Regional Authorities.

The Public Procurement Advisory Unit serves both municipal and State authorities and other public procurement units by providing them with free advice on the public procurement law, the application of the law, good practices in procurement and on the significance of strategic leadership for the provision and acquisition of services.

The Public Procurement Advisory Unit spreads information on public procurement by means of e-mail advisory services, telephone advisory services, newsletters and www-pages. It also follows the developments in the area of procurement in the EU.

The Public Procurement Advisory Unit is an independent unit working in conjunction with the Association of Finnish Local and Regional Authorities.

b) Motiva manages a help desk for public environmental technology procurement, www.motivanhankintapalvelu.fi/se. The focus is on one time investments within waste, water and energy management, public transport and construction. The service has been funded by the Ministry of Employment and trade, the Finnish Innovation Fund and the Ministry of Environment. The target group is all public procurement entities and is free, but can also provide project based consultancy in development projects and for instance arrange supply side dialogues. Capacity building is delivered by means of e-mail advisory services, telephone advisory services, newsletters and www-pages. Its start up phase ends in September 2011. Motiva is also involved in developing the GPP aspect in EU innovation policy.
8.3.3  Availability of online advice, information, handbooks

See point 3.2. above.
- Guide to GPP, Julkisten hankintojen ympäristöopas
- General guide for government procurement, Valtion hankintakäsikirja (Ministry of Finance)
- General guide for procurement in local authorities, Kuntien hankintaohje (Association of Municipalities)
- TEKES guide on competitive dialogue

8.3.4  Available tools for PP and GPP (e.g. eProcurement)

TILHA – the electronic ordering system for central government.
Motiva’s webpages include also tools for counting LCC for energy using products. These are, however, in need of updating. Several of them were developed within the EU-project Green Labels Purchasing. On the procurement service website Motiva has listed different kinds of tools, national and from other countries, for different phases in the procurement process.

8.3.5  Standard templates available (PINs, criteria, contracts etc.)

Hilma is run by the Ministry of Employment and Trade and is a free, electronic database for public sector calls of tender www.hankintailmoitus.fi

Sector wise templates for PP are available in a number of areas, for instance ICT procurement, transport services, construction, urban planning by the Association of Municipalities.

There are also available general terms of contract for e.g. ICT-services and construction.

For GPP there is a criteria database, Hymonet, operating since the 90’s. It is available for those registered in the database. Registration is based on a fee, which is also the only source of funding criteria development.

Motiva provides guidance and tools for primarily energy efficiency in public procurement. Motiva has also developed contract models for energy service contracting.

8.3.6  Existing platforms for public authorities market communication

- Hilma www.hankintailmoitus.fi
- www.hankintatieto.fi
- (www.credita.fi )
  as well as a number run by private companies
The websites of the purchasing authorities are often used for information on ongoing calls for tender.

8.3.7 Availability of funding for public authorities’ development of procurement (funding organization, object, timeframe)

TEKES, the Finnish fund for Innovation and technology, provides a possibility for the public sector to receive funding for procuring innovations. www.tekes.fi/info/julkiset_hankinnat

Within the Energy and Climate Policy, the Ministry of Employment and Trade also gives subsidies to municipalities for investments in energy efficiency and renewable energy sources. There are, however, no criteria for how the procurement should be conducted.

8.4 Procurement management

8.4.1 PP and GPP as part of strategies, rules and regulations for public bodies

a) The energy efficiency agreements which more than 60 municipalities have signed include an obligation to make energy efficiency part of purchasing. Almost 80% of these have implemented procurement guidelines on energy efficiency.

b) The national action plan for GPP includes targets that are binding for the central government, but only recommended for the local authorities. The NAP, implemented as a Finnish Government resolution on Sustainable Public Procurement (2009), sets out the following priorities and targets: (http://www.ymparisto.fi/default.asp?contentid=319422&lan=EN)

Electricity from renewable sources. The Government supports the use of renewable forms of energy through its resolution. The central government will switch to green electricity. At least 30% of purchased electricity will be produced from renewable energy sources by 2010 and at least 60% by 2015.

- Low energy and passive buildings. New government buildings or new leased properties must meet the requirements of energy efficiency class A and existing buildings under renovation must meet the requirements of at least energy efficiency class C by 2010. All buildings that are new, under renovation or leased must be passive by 2015.
- Transport on rails. The need for transport and mobility will be reduced by 10% by 2015. State officials will take into consideration the fuel consumption and emissions of vehicles purchased for mass
transport. In 2020, at least half of all new purchased or leased passenger cars will have carbon dioxide emissions of less than 120 g/km and at least 25% will be under 110 g/km.

- Sustainable eating
- The amount of organic, vegetable-based or seasonal food will be increased in foodstuff procurement for food services. These foods will be available in Government kitchens and provided by food services at least once a week in 2010 and at least twice a week by 2015.
- Criteria for energy- and eco-labels. Criteria equivalent to the requirements for energy- and eco-labels will be used as comparative principles in the procurement and leasing of energy-using equipment. Furthermore, public actors will switch to energy-efficient lighting.

c) The recommendations by the ministry of Employment and Trade on energy efficient public procurement, 2009. The recommendations focus on the most important product groups with highest energy efficiency and CO2 reduction possibilities: construction, IT-equipment, vehicles, lighting and other electronic equipment.


The focus areas of the Environmental Innovation Panel’s work are the prevention of climate change, the sustainable use of resources, protection of the Baltic Sea and air pollution control.

The Finnish Fund for Technology and Innovation, TEKES, has a funding tool for PP for innovation

Finland’s potential Lead Markets:

Material and Energy efficient public procurement is raised as an area where Motiva operates and which should be strengthened for instance by:

- Developing methods and services to assist public procurers and encourage procurement of innovation
- generating and promoting best practices
- developing practical tools for promoting procurement of innovation
- promoting dialogue and partnerships between private and public bodies
- improving procurement based training and procurement competence

e) The National policy for public procurement of wood-based products (bioenergy excluded)

In PP of wood-based products the environmental aspects of the whole lifecycle should be considered.

The policy recommends capacity building measures for both public procurers and suppliers of products and services
f) The Government procurement strategy lays down that government procurement should be done by taking sustainability into account.

g) The Association of Local authorities’ guide for public procurement in municipalities also refers to the objectives in the NAP and explains how lifecycle environmental considerations can be taken into account.

8.4.2 Auditing and enforcement of PP and GPP (who and how)

Ministry of Finance budgetary issues

Ministry of Employment and Trade, responsible for publishing statistics on PP as part of reporting to the EU.

The market Court is a special court hearing market law, competition and public procurement cases.

8.4.3 Monitoring of PP and GPP (who and how)

- Monitoring is done in Hilma by the Ministry of Employment and trade. The monitoring is done as an obligation to report to EU.

- The Ministry of Finance is currently mapping all government employees doing procurement. The focus is in implementing the government procurement strategy.

- Monitoring of GPP has been done through several surveys by the Associations of Municipalities and by Motiva. For instance Study on the impact of public procurement on energy consumption and greenhouse gas emissions


GPP in Finland has also been monitored in several international studies, in which Finnish organizations have actively been involved as the researchers:


8.4.4 Current and foreseen development of PP (subject areas, tools, organization etc.)

• Innovation policy and public procurement for innovation in Lead markets
• e-procurement and tools, ordering from framework agreements
• joint and centralized procurement: KL Kuntahankinnat, regional procurement co-operation
• threshold levels have been lifted in order to lessen the administrative burden
• legal revision of the EU Directives.
• Inclusion of obligation to procure innovations and SME-promotion?

8.4.5 Current and foreseen development of GPP (subject areas, tools, organization etc.)

• The national focal point for GPP including criteria development, internet databank and consultancy service is being discussed,
• capacity building on GPP
• Follow up of the GPP NAP
• Energy efficient public procurement put into practice in the committed municipalities who have signed an energy efficiency agreement
• Eco-innovations will continue to gain importance
• The national resources strategy forthcoming with a shift in focus towards natural resources and dangerous substances
• Forthcoming EU policy document on energy efficiency
9. Sammanfattning

Grön offentlig upphandling är fortfarande främst ett miljöpolitiskt instrument i de nordiska länderna och utvecklas separat från annan politik för offentlig upphandling. Andra politikområden som berör offentlig upphandling är t.ex. energi-, innovations- och konkurrenspolitiken samt effektiviseringen av offentlig förvaltning. Inom ramen för dessa vidtas åtgärder för att förbättra och underlätta upphandlingsförfaranden och medvetna val i den offentliga sektorn. Denna kartläggning gjordes i Finland, Sverige, Danmark, Norge och Island och visar betydande potensiella kopplingar mellan grön upphandling och annan policyutveckling. Miljöaspekter och beaktande av livscykelperspektivet borde utgöra en del av denna utveckling genom att erbjuda nödvändiga verktyg för att få största totalekonomiska nytta för spenderade offentliga medel. Om detta inte sker, är risken stor att grön upphandling fortblir en separat aspekt för offentliga upphandlande enheter att beakta då det anses nödvändigt och på olika sätt, vilket förvirrar marknaden.

9.1 Rekommendationer


En betydande gemensam brist i alla länderna är den statistiska informationen om offentlig upphandling. Nationella databaser för konkurrensutövning och de eUpphandlingssystem som är under utveckling skulle kunna underlätta uppföljningen av grön offentlig upphandling. Livscykelpostgons bör integreras i såväl generella som produkt- och sektorspecifika upphandlingsverktyg.
Mainstreaming GPP in the Nordic countries
– a scoping study

This report contains the results of a scoping study on the potential for mainstreaming green public procurement in the Nordic countries. The report gives recommendations on how green public procurement can be better integrated in other policy areas. The study was financed by the Nordic Council of Ministers’ Working group on Sustainable Consumption and Production.