

# Trafficking in Human Beings

Report from a conference on *Identification of victims and criminals*  
– *why we do not notice them*



CONFERENCE PROCEEDING







# **Trafficking in Human Beings**

Report from a conference on *Identification of victims and criminals – why we do not notice them*

Trafficking in Human Beings  
Report from a conference on *Identification of victims and criminals - why we do not notice them*

ISBN 978-92-893-2767-1  
ISBN 978-92-893-2768-8 (EPUB)  
<http://dx.doi.org/10.6027/TN2014-526>

TemaNord 2014:526  
ISSN 0908-6692

© Nordic Council of Ministers 2014

Layout: Hanne Lebech  
Cover photo: Beate Nøsterud  
Photo: Reelika Riimand

Print: Rosendahls-Schultz Grafisk  
Copies: 516

Printed in Denmark



This publication has been published with financial support by the Nordic Council of Ministers. However, the contents of this publication do not necessarily reflect the views, policies or recommendations of the Nordic Council of Ministers.

[www.norden.org/en/publications](http://www.norden.org/en/publications)

#### **Nordic co-operation**

*Nordic co-operation* is one of the world's most extensive forms of regional collaboration, involving Denmark, Finland, Iceland, Norway, Sweden, and the Faroe Islands, Greenland, and Åland.

*Nordic co-operation* has firm traditions in politics, the economy, and culture. It plays an important role in European and international collaboration, and aims at creating a strong Nordic community in a strong Europe.

*Nordic co-operation* seeks to safeguard Nordic and regional interests and principles in the global community. Common Nordic values help the region solidify its position as one of the world's most innovative and competitive.

#### **Nordic Council of Ministers**

Ved Stranden 18  
DK-1061 Copenhagen K  
Phone (+45) 3396 0200

[www.norden.org](http://www.norden.org)

# Content

Summary .....	7
1. Opening of the Conference .....	9
2. Trafficking in Human Beings – Challenges Today.....	13
2.1 Leading criminal investigations and collecting evidence in human trafficking cases.....	13
2.2 Evidence-related problems in human trafficking cases .....	14
3. New Trends in Human Trafficking .....	17
3.1 Latvian legislation in combating human trafficking.....	17
3.2 Combating human trafficking, forced labour and sexual exploitation in Russia.....	18
3.3 Social dumping or trafficking? .....	20
4. Migration and Profiling.....	23
4.1 Irregular migration, borders, and profiling .....	23
4.2 Combating human trafficking: A case from the criminal police.....	24
5. Networking and Cooperation.....	27
5.1 Benefits of networking .....	27
5.2 European strategy for the Baltic Sea Region (EUSBSR): Bilateral cooperation between Lithuania and Norwegian Police in cases of human trafficking.....	29
5.3 Early identification and cross-sector cooperation .....	29
5.4 Joint task-force to combat human trafficking: cooperation between police and tax authorities in Denmark.....	31
6. Panel and Round-Table Discussions .....	35
6.1 Panel Discussion: Victim or Victimized .....	35
6.2 Round-Table Discussions: Identification of Victims and Criminals – Why We Do not Notice Them? .....	36
6.3 Links .....	38
7. Appendix.....	39
7.1 Identification of Victims and Criminals – Why We Do Not Notice Them? .....	39
Sammanfattning.....	41





# Summary

The Nordic Council of Ministers for Nordic Cooperation (MR-SAM) approved in 2011 a program for a concerted effort through Nordic Council of Ministers (NCM) activities to combat trafficking in human beings in the Northern Dimension Region of the European Union. Since 2001, NCM has actively combated trafficking in human beings within the framework of Nordic cooperation and in cooperation with the Baltic countries and Northwest Russia. The fight against human trafficking requires both international cooperation and coordination in order to be effective. NCM cooperates with international organizations and task-forces to avoid overlap in activities.

In the Nordic countries, most of the reported cases of trafficking in human beings today concern women and girls trafficked for sexual exploitation, but experiences from Europe indicate that human trafficking has increased also in farming, household work, construction, and house building, as well as in begging, shoplifting and thefts.

*Trafficking in Human Beings with a Focus on Forced Labor, Children and Sex Trafficking* is a knowledge-building and networking project and is part of NCM's joint efforts in 2011–2013 to combat trafficking in human beings in the Northern Dimension Region of the European Union.

The purpose of the project has been to present Nordic, Baltic and Russian achievements and best practices in combating trafficking used by police and border guards in NW Russia, Estonia, Latvia, Lithuania and the Nordic countries. The project has brought together experts from police and border guards and various authorities and organizations that daily work with human trafficking issues with the aim of building knowledge and competence in combating human trafficking. The project has focused on new forms of human trafficking in the forms of forced labour and trafficking in children. New trends in human trafficking for sexual exploitation have also been discussed.

The aim of this Nordic-Baltic-Northwest Russian cooperation project has also been to strengthen the regional operational network involved in combating human trafficking through joint Russian-Baltic-Nordic study visits to Estonia, Finland, Norway and Sweden. The study visits were arranged in 2012–2013 to Helsinki, Stockholm, Oslo, Tallinn and Narva.

The project was coordinated by the Nordic-Baltic Network of Police-women (NBNP) and administrated by the NCM Office in Estonia.

The conference *Identification of victims and criminals – why we do not notice them* on 30th–31st May 2013 in Tallinn, Estonia formed the conclusion of a Nordic-Baltic-Northwest Russian cooperation project that ran for over one year. In the framework of the project's study visits, officials and experts learned about achievements and success stories in the identification of victims as part of the fight against human trafficking. Around 80 participants attended the two-day conference to discuss ways of identifying victims and criminals and to find answer to the question of why we do not notice victims or criminals, even though we now have available to us facts, figures, research and knowledge about human trafficking as a part of international organized crime.

NBNP administrated and coordinated a knowledge-building and networking project on *Efforts to combat trafficking in human beings for sexual exploitation* in 2009–2010. Study visits focused on trafficking in human beings and on how police, institutions and experts have developed systems to fight human trafficking in Northern Europe. As a result, a Nordic-Baltic-Russian network of policemen working daily with combating trafficking in human beings was created. This project is a step toward further strengthening a Nordic-Baltic-Russian platform to combat human trafficking in the Northern Dimension Region of the European Union.

This report presents a summary of the conference, including summaries of the presentations, the Panel discussion and the recommendations from the Panel discussions. The conference program can be found in Appendix 1. All presentations are published on the homepage of the Nordic Council of Ministers Office in Estonia. <http://www.norden.ee/en/welfare-society/presentations>.



NBNP conference group.

# 1. Opening of the Conference

*Raigo Haabu, Police Colonel, Deputy Director General Criminal Police Department of Estonian Police and Border Guard Board*



Raigo Habu, Estonia.

Deputy Director General Raigo Haabu started his speech by quoting Commissioner Cecilia Malmström and saying that special interest should be paid to victims of human trafficking as especially vulnerable persons.

Haabu described the new legislation in Estonia that entered into force on 14th April 2012. According to Haabu:

“In recent years Estonia has taken serious measures to enhance the fight against human trafficking. In 2012, for example, the section regarding enslavement was replaced with human trafficking in the Penal Code, which is a very serious type of criminal offence and concerns a serious violation of human freedom and dignity. Among other things, the Penal Code was updated with a new paragraph stipulating support measures for human trafficking. Separate provisions have been stipulated for human trafficking that takes advantage of minors.”

He also described how difficult it is in court to prove that a case is about human trafficking and not just that the victim has signed a bad employment contract. It is time now to start to understand the victims and establish good cooperation with NGOs and organizations that combat human trafficking. Haabu stressed that usually people become victims of human

trafficking as a result of social problems as well as mobility and moving to other countries to find work – often a job they see as a “dream job”.

Haabu closed his opening speech by stating that Estonia has ratified the European Councils’ Convention on Combating Trafficking, which grants better protection for victims and promotes cooperation between different organizations. Haabu:

“We have repeatedly talked about the victims of human trafficking. It is the victim who must be made the priority in human trafficking cases. This requirement is also stipulated in a directive of the European Commission, and I am pleased to announce that Estonia, which has formerly been repeatedly criticized for its insufficient victim protection, has taken serious measures to improve this situation in recent years. We have ratified the Council of Europe Convention on action against trafficking in human beings, which ensures better protection for the victims and closer cooperation between different authorities. It is possible to provide a legislative basis for the people engaged in the field, but the protection of actual victims must be addressed by actual people. It is only through our own perception and understanding of the victims that we can protect them and offer the victims the services and the help they need.”

- *Read more (in Estonian):* [http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/RaigoHaabu\\_trafficking\\_30312013.pdf](http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/RaigoHaabu_trafficking_30312013.pdf)

*Berth Sundström, Director, Nordic Council of Ministers Office in Estonia*

Director Berth Sundström started his opening speech by saying that the Nordic Council of Ministers combats all forms of human trafficking and is actively working to strengthen cooperation in the Nordic region and particularly with the neighboring countries – the three Baltic States and Northwest Russia. The conference will discuss new forms of human trafficking, such as forced labour and begging, but also explore the identification of victims and criminal offenders and especially why identifying victims is so difficult. Sundström emphasized that illegal immigrants are in the worst situation, as they are willing to take chances and therefore are at risk of ending up as victims. There is an overall need for better understanding and for developing competence.



Berth Sundström, Nordic Council of Ministers.

Since 2010, when the first project was completed, the NCM knowledge-building and networking programs have put the focus on human trafficking and police cooperation, and have now been expanded to include border guards. After the first study tour in the autumn of 2009, Iceland received its first case when a Lithuanian woman on a flight to Reykjavík revealed that she was a victim of trafficking. While investigating the case, the Icelandic police officer, who attended the study tour, was able to use the Lithuanian contacts he had made – which meant that the case could be brought to court within two months.

Sundström pointed out that there are no easy solutions in the fight against human trafficking. He noted that there has been a lot talk about cooperation between countries, but that each country is constantly faced with new challenges that also require them to work with other partners

– including partners that have not necessarily been involved in the process before. Sundström ended his remarks by saying that:

“...we will only solve the problem if we all contribute and take our responsibilities seriously. We all have our role to play in the prevention of trafficking, supporting victims and prosecuting the perpetrators. It’s also important to remember that human trafficking takes place because there’s a demand for it – especially in prosperous countries, including the Nordic region.”

- Read more: [http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/BerthSundstrom\\_trafficking\\_speech\\_3031052013.pdf](http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/BerthSundstrom_trafficking_speech_3031052013.pdf)

## 2. Trafficking in Human Beings – Challenges Today

### 2.1 Leading criminal investigations and collecting evidence in human trafficking cases

*Kati Miitra, State Prosecutor, Office of the Prosecutor General, Estonia*

State Prosecutor Kati Miitra started her presentation by describing the Estonian legislation on human trafficking. The legislation is based on the Conventions of both the UN and the Council of Europe. Miitra said that Estonia is today both a country of origin and a country of transit, as many persons who enter Estonia illegally either go on further or are sent out to other countries. Not all illegal immigrants are victims of human trafficking, but they are easy victims for criminal offenders. Investigations into cases of prostitutions often do not focus on human trafficking. Today, criminal offenders are not using violence to force people to travel abroad, and often those who become victims of human trafficking stress that they travelled abroad of their own free will. Miitra also described the Estonian victim support act and different support systems victims can use in Estonia. She pointed out that one of the problems in solving cases is that victims often lie about such information as their name, age, country of origin etc. In Miitra's view cooperation with border guards is essential in conducting surveillance as traffickers transfer illegal property across borders and smuggle bulk currency.

Miitra stressed the importance of international cooperation through Eurojust and Europol, emphasizing that it is important for countries to join forces on joint investigation teams and provide mutual legal assistance to combat human trafficking.

- Read More (in Estonian): [http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/KatiMiitra\\_trafficking\\_3031052013.pdf](http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/KatiMiitra_trafficking_3031052013.pdf)

## 2.2 Evidence-related problems in human trafficking cases

*Laima Garnelienė, Judge, Court of Appeals, Lithuania*



Laima Garnelienė, Lithuania.

Judge Laima Garnelienė started by saying that

“Trafficking in human beings is a crime, which violates the fundamental human rights and freedoms, and usually goes beyond the borders of one state; thus, human trafficking is a global problem, which must be addressed by bringing together the forces of separate states and organizations.”

Garnelienė presented the UN definition of human trafficking and described the development of combating human trafficking within the UN, European Council and EU Parliament as well as in Lithuania, where the description of the crime of human trafficking first appeared in Lithuanian law in 1998. Today, the liability for human trafficking is established in several articles in the Criminal Code. According to Garnelienė, one of the challenges of combating human trafficking is the proper execution of a pre-trial investigation and collection of sufficient evidence so that persons who have committed such a crime are prosecuted. She stressed that:

“Each chain link – prevention, control, crime detection, conviction of guilty persons, and assistance to a victim of trafficking – is very important in combating trafficking in human beings.”

Garnelienė gave also an overview of the criminal cases in Lithuania during the last few years, the difficulties in collecting sufficient evidence and the problems that stem from the different legal systems when several countries are involved in the pre-trial investigations.



Garnelienė concluded by saying:

“It can be stated that combating trafficking in human beings undoubtedly results in a variety of specific challenges as well as problematic issues, which will never be fully resolved; however, it is very important to not stop looking for new ways of combating, to keep sharing the experiences and observations of various countries in this area, just like we are doing today, in this conference, so that the number of victims in this criminal offence is reduced to the minimum and the existing victims feel properly supported and receive the necessary assistance.”

- Read more: [http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/LaimaGarneliene\\_trafficking\\_3031052013.pdf](http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/LaimaGarneliene_trafficking_3031052013.pdf)



## 3. New Trends in Human Trafficking

### 3.1 Latvian legislation in combating human trafficking

*Arturs Vaišļa, Expert, Former Head of Human Trafficking Unit of State Police (2003–2012), Riga, Latvia*



Arturs Vaišļa, Latvia.

Expert Arturs Vaišļa started by asking: How to fight human trafficking? He answered that we can do it in several ways: on a high level in UN, EU and regional organizations or on a low level at meetings and working groups – organize demonstrations to support victims, draft conventions and recommendations, or just fight against organized human trafficking in our own countries.

Vaišļa described the work of Latvian law enforcement agencies to combat human trafficking, the cooperation between the special police unit, international cooperation and cooperation with NGOs on rehabilitation of victims as well as the preventive work carried out in Latvian society. Latvia has developed effective national legislation to combat human trafficking. Vaišļa gave an overview of the Latvian legislation and indicators to combat human trafficking and also described Latvian cases of sexual exploitation among both adults and minors. Sham marriages are the new trend in Latvia in human trafficking. What exactly is this phenome-

non? Is it a violation of immigration law, marriage fraud, bigamy, or human trafficking? Women from Latvia are offered money to marry men from India, Pakistan or Bangladesh, and the women are asked to travel to Ireland to marry men from outside the EU. In Latvia, the first trend of sham marriages occurred already in 2002, and since then Latvia has taken steps to combat sham marriages as a way of obtaining Latvian citizenship and as part of human trafficking crimes. An article supplementing the Criminal Law came into force on 1st April 2013.

Vaišļa concluded by saying that adjusted legislation and establishing an effective special police unit have decreased human trafficking in children and women in Latvia.

- Read more: [http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/SergeiAndreitco\\_trafficking\\_3031052013.pdf](http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/SergeiAndreitco_trafficking_3031052013.pdf)

### 3.2 Combating human trafficking, forced labour and sexual exploitation in Russia

*Sergei Andreitco, Professor of Constitutional and International Law, St. Petersburg University of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of Russia*



Sergei Andreitco, Russia.

Professor Sergei Andreitco presented the Russian system of authorities involved in combating human trafficking and described the special department at the Ministry of Justice, as well as the many other authorities dealing with migration, immigrants and forced labour issues. The Russian Border Guard Department and State Labour Inspectorate regularly work with human trafficking issues. Many NGOs work with victims, and

in St. Petersburg, especially the Red Cross arranges seminars and also maintains a shelter for victims of human trafficking. Today, not many human trafficking cases have been initiated in Russia, and all forms of human trafficking are seen as complicated issues, also because authorities and NGOs often present different facts and statistics. The punishment right now for a human trafficking crime is up to 15 years in prison, depending on how serious the crime is considered.



Participants listening to challenges with human trafficking today.

Andreitco said that forced labour is the biggest problem in Russia today. About 10–15 million foreigners are working in Russia and most of them come from countries of the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS) and most work in Moscow and St. Petersburg. Citizens of CIS countries can travel to Russia and stay on and work for three months without a visa registration card. Currently, the goal of the Russian efforts against human trafficking is to protect people from becoming victims of forced labour. Andreitco stressed that it is a challenge to fight forced labour, as many of the migrants do not know their rights, or the Russian law, do not speak Russian, and are often afraid of coming in contact with authorities. There is now a need in Russia to improve law enforcement and cooperation between authorities at different levels both within Russia but also with the neighbouring countries. The aim is for Russia to create a more effective immigration system. There are a lot of information materials about the different forms of human trafficking. The Red Cross and NCM have also arranged trainings and seminars to raise awareness of

the different forms of human trafficking. What is needed in Russia now is international cross-sector and cross-border cooperation.

- Read more (in Russian): [http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/SergeiAndreitco\\_trafficking\\_3031052013.pdf](http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/SergeiAndreitco_trafficking_3031052013.pdf)

### 3.3 Social dumping or trafficking?

*Knut Bråttvik, Police Superintendent, National Criminal Investigation Service (KRIPOS), Oslo, Norway*

Police Superintendent Knut Bråttvik started with an overview of actions taken in Norway to combat human trafficking. Today there is greater awareness in Norway about the exploitation of children as victims of human trafficking, but more experts need to be involved in identifying child victims of human trafficking. More focus should also be paid to forced labour, labour inspectors should be trained to identify victims, and social workers should be included in the support measures for human trafficking. Bråttvik emphasized the importance of capacity building for judges as well as training and cooperation for the border and immigration police, and said that there is still a lot to learn for all groups involved in combating human trafficking.

Today's growing labour immigration has led to problems with social dumping in many Nordic countries, particularly in certain industries and sectors. Social dumping is deemed to be present both if foreign employees are subjected to violations of health, safety and working environment regulations and if they are paid wages that are unacceptably low. As of yet, there is no clear definition of social dumping.

Bråttvik presented a Norwegian case from 2012, where an Indian citizen working in a plant shop contacted the local police and reported unacceptable working conditions. Is this a case of social dumping or is it a case of human trafficking? The plant shop is owned by an Indian citizen with permanent residence in Norway. The Indian workers are recruited from India and transported to Norway. When they arrive in Norway, their passports are taken away, they are given Norwegian SIM cards for their mobile phones and told not to speak to Norwegians. If the police address them, they must pretend that they just speak their own Indian language. These Indian workers get paid ten times less than a Norwegian citizen for the same work and the same hours. The case of

Indian workers is under consideration in Norway right now, and Bråttvik concluded by telling about the process of the ongoing police investigation.

- Read More: [http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/KnutBrattvik\\_trafficking\\_3031052013.pdf](http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/KnutBrattvik_trafficking_3031052013.pdf)





## 4. Migration and Profiling

### 4.1 Irregular migration, borders, and profiling

*Ago Tikk, Border Guard Major, Head of Risk Analysis Division, Intelligence Bureau, Border Guard Department, Police and Border Guard Board, Estonia*

Ago Tikk, Head of Risk Analysis Division, began by saying that yesterday's profiles and understanding of irregular migration are not valid today, and today's profiles and understanding of irregular migration will not be valid tomorrow. The main reason for migration is companies' demand for cheap labour.

Tikk described the background and reasons for migration to and from Europe and the challenges border guards meet in trying to detect victims of human trafficking. Most of the victims of human trafficking look like ordinary people when they are crossing borders. Traffickers also give clear instructions how the trafficked should behave at check points, and the traffickers are brilliant in changing systems and adapting to new situations and rules. Tikk also said that victims do not talk, they do not know their destinations, and they do not have contact with the traffickers, so it is a low risk for the human traffickers to transport people around the world. The profits from human trafficking are used for individual luxury (houses, cars, boats, etc.), drugs, sex and labour slavery, and to support war and terrorism.

Tikk asked what should be done to solve the problem and stressed that delegating the problems across one's borders is of no use. Tikk presented policy recommendations for our countries in order to:

- deal with the main reasons for migration in the countries of origin
- establish stricter controls in the labour market
- close illegal businesses
- establish cooperation between police, immigration authorities, tax authorities and the social service sector
- declare zero tolerance and impose heavy penalties on traffickers
- confiscate all assets earned through human trafficking

- develop preventive methods and conduct awareness-raising activities regarding human trafficking.
- Read more: [http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/AgoTikk\\_trafficking\\_3031052013.pdf](http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/AgoTikk_trafficking_3031052013.pdf)

## 4.2 Combating human trafficking: A case from the criminal police

*Ago Leis, Police Captain, Head of Division, Investigation Bureau, National Criminal Police, Police and Border Guard Board, Estonia*

Head of Division Ago Leis presented an Estonian case from 2012, when six Vietnamese persons (one of them a 4-year-old child) were found when a minibus was stopped in Estonia. Usually Estonia is considered a transit country, not a country of destination, for victims of human trafficking. The largest Vietnamese communities in Europe are found in Poland, Germany and France. Vietnamese people are trafficked because they are willing to work in any country and in all sectors. Vietnamese workers are very cheap labour and do not go to the police. The victims are totally dependent on the traffickers and individuals have no travel or identification documents. Leis also described the conditions in which the victims are forced to live.



Sigrid Lie, Norway.

Leis presented the Estonian legislation on human trafficking and the challenges of solving human trafficking cases from the perspective of the criminal police. According to Leis, international cooperation between police, border guards and other authorities is the key to solving these crimes. In addition, these types of international human trafficking crimes require very quick decisions and actions. Finally, Leis presented the 2013 judgment from the Estonian court in the case of the Vietnamese people who had been trafficked to Estonia in 2012.



## 5. Networking and Cooperation

### 5.1 Benefits of networking

*Jarle Bjørke, Police Superintendent, Head of Analysis Division, Organized Crime Section, Bergen Police, Norway, and Andres Väliste, Chief Inspector, Senior Investigator, Division of Organized and Serious Crime, Crime Bureau, Northern Prefecture, Police and Border Guard Board, Estonia.*

Police Superintendent Jarle Bjørke and Chief Inspector Andres Väliste presented the benefits of networking by telling what they personally had experienced by participating in both the study visits and conferences arranged within the framework of the NCM networking and knowledge-building projects to combat human trafficking, coordinated by NBNP.

According to Bjørke:

“Networking for me is – both on a professional level and personal level – very important. I use my network when I need knowledge on specific subjects in my work. Through all the years of participating in conferences, meetings etc, I have learned a lot from other colleagues from around the world – both culturally [and in terms of] police issues and politics. I have over the years met so many wonderful people. Some of them have become close friends whom I visit privately and they visit me. All over I would say that networking and meeting people/colleagues from around the world gives you inspiration and knowledge.”

Väliste continued:

“If you are referring to these conferences by NBNP I would say first of all it is making the Nordic-Baltic area of policing smaller, making it easier to investigate cross-border cases between the countries. Personally I have made some good mates I intend to keep in touch with in the future.”

Bjørke and Väliste pointed out that networking consist of the exchange of experience, knowledge and information, exchange of history, culture, stories, exchange of moments, reflections, and memories, and that being “face-to-face” makes exchanging easier.

Networking makes it easier to:

- Achieve our national & international commitments
- Verify the victims of THB
- Verify the traffickers
- Exchange experiences, knowledge, information
- Exchange information on traffickers, networks, methods
- Obtain local knowledge about victims of trafficking
- Describe vulnerabilities
- Prevent recruitment
- Help one another
- Carry out public information campaigns.



Participants discuss why it is important to network and cooperate.

Bjørke and Väliste asked: *What is the most important factor for success in the fight against human trafficking?* Their answer was: All who have participated in the project have a role in the network, whether you are a police officer, prosecutor, member of an NGO; all involved in the project, all together play a role in the network. And they asked *Why?* and responded: because theory needs to be converted into practice.

Bjørke and Väliste believe that NBNP gives people the possibility to cooperate, and in some cases they also become friends for life – and that all this is the benefit and result of Nordic-Baltic-Russian networking.

- Read more: [http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/AndresJarle\\_trafficking\\_3031052013.pdf](http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/AndresJarle_trafficking_3031052013.pdf)

## 5.2 European strategy for the Baltic Sea Region (EUSBSR): Bilateral cooperation between Lithuania and Norwegian Police in cases of human trafficking

*Knut Bråttvik, Police Superintendent, National Criminal Investigation Service (KRIPOS), Oslo, Norway*

Police Superintendent Knut Bråttvik presented the bilateral cooperation between Lithuanian and Norwegian police in cases of human trafficking. According to him, Lithuania is the source country for Norway being a country of destination. The target group in the cooperation consists of vulnerable persons who are transported from Lithuania to Norway, as well as organized criminal groups from Lithuania. Most of the known victims were exploited for sexual services and used for petty crimes. Analysis of human trafficking shows that Lithuanian organized crime groups play an active role in the organization of trafficking in human beings to the Nordic countries.

The aim of the bilateral cooperation is to identify potential traffickers and their victims, collect and combine data to identify persons using similar operational methods, and to strengthen cooperation between Norwegian and Lithuanian human trafficking investigation units. The aim is also to establish rapid and informal exchange of information on human trafficking victims and suspects as well as joint operational activities based on intelligence data. Bråttvik concluded by saying that Norway and Lithuania will work out investigations independently and if necessary, establish a Joint Investigation Team (JIT).

- Read more: [http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/KnutBrattvik\\_EUSBSR\\_trafficking\\_3031052013.pdf](http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/KnutBrattvik_EUSBSR_trafficking_3031052013.pdf)

## 5.3 Early identification and cross-sector cooperation

*Petri Lamppu, Detective Chief Inspector, Senior Investigator, Southwest Finland Police, Turku, Finland*

Detective Chief Inspector Petri Lamppu's presentation focused on a case in the City of Turku in Southwest Finland concerning illegal immigration and extortionate work discrimination in a local pizzeria. The pre-trial investigations were based on the observations of the police, and customs and border guards. Lamppu described the content of the pre-trial investigations of the joint investigation team, which included video hearings, telecommunication interceptions, requests for international judicial assistance, bank account information, timecard working time reports, videos recorded by injured parties etc.

The pre-trial ended in 2012 with 18 injured parties, out of them three for aggravated human trafficking (aggravated usury), one for human trafficking, and 14 for extortionate work discrimination. There were five suspects all from the same family, and the total amount of economic benefit from all economic fraud included unpaid taxes and employment pension insurance etc. Lamppu described the rulings of the District Court, which for the main suspect was four years of imprisonment and the obligation to pay compensation totalling EUR 494,000 for e.g. unpaid wages.

At the end, Lamppu described some of the difficulties with investigating human trafficking cases:

- As in many other cases, not all injured parties saw themselves as "victims."
- Tax authorities do not pay any attention to business activities, even though, as in this case, the inexplicable property gain in 2009/2010 was estimated to be EUR 120,000.
- The investigation took about one year, and the court trial an additional year. A lot of people were involved in the whole process, e.g. 70 persons from different authorities were involved on the day of the arrest.
- Interpreting costs were enormous, around EUR 30,000 for just the pre-trial investigation.
- Read more: [http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/PetriLamppu\\_trafficking\\_3031052013.pdf](http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/PetriLamppu_trafficking_3031052013.pdf)



#### 5.4 Joint task-force to combat human trafficking: cooperation between police and tax authorities in Denmark

*Carsten Ahrends, Police Superintendent, Central Investigation Department, Copenhagen Police, Denmark, and John Vorbeck Petersen, Project Manager, Danish Customs and Tax Administration, Copenhagen, Denmark*

Project Manager John Vorbeck Petersen and Detective Chief Inspector Trine Møller (who gave the presentation on Carsten Ahrends' behalf) described the joint activities of the Tax Administration in Denmark and the Danish Police. According to Vorbeck Petersen, the tax administration is good at figures and the police are good at investigations, and this is a base for fruitful cooperation. Vorbeck Petersen and Møller presented the joint activities of the Danish Tax Administration and Police in the fight against human trafficking. The objective of Danish tax authorities is to assist the Danish Police with economic information, such as private consumption (e.g. how someone could afford to buy an expensive car etc.), ownership of real estate, and ownership of expensive assets. The tax authorities only exchange information with the Police to the extent allowed by Danish law, as well as the tax information that is crucial for the case.



Trine Møller, Denmark.

The joint case of “Operation Hungarian Studio” concerned three brothels with the same backer and the same girls. The Tax Project Group begins to investigate economic transactions such as: who is the owner of the studio (real estate), what is the economic status of the backer (owner), from where does the backer get the income, does the backer declare and pay taxes etc. The Tax Project Group visits the studio, assisted by local police to collect evidence, such as work schedules, which prove that the backer does not pay taxes. The evidence is sent to the police and cooperation begins with the Copenhagen Police Central Investigation Department. The police and tax authorities pay visits to the brothels and find that all of the young women working there are from Hungary, are all paying 50% of what they earn to the backer, and additionally DKK 50 per day for “protection.”



Kalle Laanet, Estonia, Anu Leps, Estonia and John Vorbeck, Denmark.

Based on the investigation, the profits are calculated to be DKK 11,780,672. Møller described the judgement that was delivered in June 2012 and said that the backer was sentenced to prison for one year and 9 months and deported from Denmark and given an entry ban for 12 years. The court concluded that she had made a profit of DKK 7 million (EUR 950,000), and the court confiscated the DKK 7 million (EUR 950,000) from the backer.

Vorbeck presented the joint results from the cooperation between the Danish Tax Administration and the Danish Police between 1st January 2009 and 31st December 2012:

- Ongoing cases referring to procuring (pimps) and human trafficking: 128 cases.
- Sentences in 72 tax cases with the result of EUR 4,800,000.
- 56 cases have been reported by the Danish Tax Administration to the Danish Police.

Vorbeck and Møller concluded by saying that there is a need for international cooperation and networking across borders with all relevant authorities, and fast answers to inquiries are needed in order to get effective results in the fight against human trafficking.

- Read more: [http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/CarstenAhrends\\_trafficking\\_3031052013.pdf](http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/info/inimkaubandus/may2013/CarstenAhrends_trafficking_3031052013.pdf)



## 6. Panel and Round-Table Discussions

### 6.1 Panel Discussion: Victim or Victimized

*Chair: Senior Adviser Maria-Pia de Palo, Nordic Council of Ministers*

**Panelists:**

- *Sergei Andreitco*, Professor, St. Petersburg, Russia
- *Sirle Blumberg*, Director, Tallinn, Estonia
- *Laima Garnelienė*, Judge, Vilnius, Lithuania
- *Petri Lamppu*, Detective Chief Inspector, Turku, Finland
- *Kati Miitra*, State Prosecutor, Tallinn, Estonia
- *Arturs Vaišļa*, Expert, Riga, Latvia

The panel discussion focused on the questions of *who are the victims, why do they become victims, and why are they victimized*. The panel began by discussing the vulnerable position of the victims. It was pointed out that criminals know the situation of socially vulnerable families better than social workers and the police, and that is why members of vulnerable families become easy victims of human traffickers. Very often the victims have no education and, as many people dream of a better life, people often accept an offer to get a proper job abroad. It was also pointed out that the victims have a different status in different situations. For the police and the prosecutor, a victim is an important witness in a case to sentence criminals in court. NGOs, on the other hand, see a victim as a person to be defended who should be informed about her/his human rights. The panel agreed that all those who fight human trafficking, whether it is an authority or an NGO, all share the same goal: to stop the traffickers and organized international criminals from using women, men and children for sexual exploitation, forced labour, begging, shoplifting and pick-pocketing.

Senior Adviser Maria-Pia de Palo, the chair of the panel discussion, summed up by saying, that there are no easy solutions in the fight against human trafficking. It is important for the countries to cooperate also with

regard to the position of victims and repatriation programs, but constantly new challenges require that authorities and organizations must also cooperate with new partners they are not used to working with. Cooperation and cross-border actions by authorities, international organizations, trade unions, the private sector and NGOs are essential. In fact, the problems can only be solved if all involved partners contribute and take their responsibility seriously. All have a role to play in the prevention of trafficking, in supporting the victims, and in prosecuting the traffickers.

## 6.2 Round-Table Discussions: Identification of Victims and Criminals – Why We Do not Notice Them?

The participants of the conference were divided into nine Round-Table groups and the groups were asked to discuss *Identification of victims and criminals – why we do not see them?*

We now have a lot of knowledge and research concerning victims, traffickers, middlemen and criminals, and still we cannot recognize the victims and the traffickers at check points like passport and customs controls.

The question for the Round-Table participants was: *What can we do in the future to identify them?* The Round-Table groups were asked to give recommendations and proposals for better identification and more effective activities to combat human trafficking in the Nordic and Baltic countries and in Russia.



The Round Table discussions focused on victims and why we do not notice them.

The Round-Table discussions resulted in the *following proposals*:

- Need for information to change attitudes.
- Raise overall awareness about human trafficking in our societies – there is a need to change attitudes on human dignity.
- Need for campaigns using all media channels – regular prevention information campaigns paid by the states.
- Information campaigns also within the police force at all levels.
- Information campaigns in schools.
- It is a problem of society – the buyers on the sex/black market are men.

Need for education and training:

- Knowledge and understanding – training in the police academy.
- Educate the police force at all levels, the prosecutors, and the judges through the use of international experience.

Cooperation:

- Better cooperation between local police, border guards and NGOs.
- Interagency cooperation – more cooperation/working together between countries.
- Closer cooperation with NGOs – build mutual trust between different public and private groups – learn from each other – be better and more effective together.
- Combating forced labour requires multi-sector cooperation and the involvement of both trade unions and the labour inspectorate.
- More cooperation between transit and destination countries.
- Joint Nordic-Baltic-Russian meetings to exchange experiences on combating human trafficking.

Tools:

- Specialized dedicated/educated police expert groups/units in all police districts – training, support, advice and exchange of experiences.
- Legislation should be a better tool in making it difficult for the traffickers to exploit people and in facilitating investigations.
- Confiscate the money and property (real estate, cars) from traffickers.
- Nordic-Baltic-Russian discussions: are today's tools for combating human trafficking good enough?

- Support programs for victims, financed by the state.
- Use police officers in investigations as interpreters.

### 6.3 Links

- About the conference <http://www.norden.ee/en/about-us/news/item/7847-trafficking-in-human-beings-identification-of-victims-and-criminals-challenges-and-new-trends>.
- Conference program [http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/arhiiv/programme\\_trafficking\\_3031052013.pdf](http://www.norden.ee/images/heaolu/arhiiv/programme_trafficking_3031052013.pdf)
- Conference presentation <http://www.norden.ee/en/welfare-society/presentations>.
- Nordic-Baltic Network of Policewomen <http://www.nbnp.eu/>
- Nordic Council of Ministers Office in Estonia [www.norden.ee](http://www.norden.ee)
- Nordic Council of Ministers <https://www.norden.org>
- Council of Europe Convention [http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/trafficking/Docs/Convntn/default\\_en.asp](http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/trafficking/Docs/Convntn/default_en.asp)
- GRETA [http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/trafficking/Docs/Monitoring/GRETA\\_en.asp](http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/trafficking/Docs/Monitoring/GRETA_en.asp)



## 7. Appendix

Final Conference of Nordic-Baltic-North-West Russian Networking Project: Combating Trafficking in Human Beings for Forced Labour, Children and Sexual Exploitation.

### 7.1 Identification of Victims and Criminals – Why We Do Not Notice Them?

#### Programme

Date: 30th–31st May 2013  
Venue: Hotel Meriton Grand, Paldiski mnt 4, Tallinn, Estonia  
Languages: Estonian & English & Russian  
Moderator: Anna Markina, University of Tartu, Institute of Public Law

#### 29 May

18.30 Reception in the Nordic Council of Ministers' Office in Estonia (Lai 29, Tallinn)

#### 30 May

09.00	Registration & coffee	
09.30	Opening	
	Raigo Haabu, Police Colonel, Deputy Director General, Criminal Police Department of Estonian Police and Border Guard Board Berth Sundström, Director, Nordic Council of Ministers' Office in Estonia	
09.45	Trafficking In Human Beings – Challenges Today	
	<i>Leading Criminal Investigations and Collecting Evidence in the THB Cases</i> Kati Miiira, State Prosecutor, Office of the Prosecutor General	Estonia
	<i>Evidence Related Problems in THB Cases</i> Laima Garneliene, Judge, Court of Appeal	Lithuania
10.40	Break	
11.10	New Trends In Human Trafficking	
	Latvian Legislation on Combating Human Trafficking Arturs Vaišļa, Expert, Former Head of Human Trafficking Unit of State Police (2003–2012)	Latvia
	<i>Combating Human Trafficking, Forced Labour and Sexual Exploitation in Russia</i> Sergei Andreitco, Professor of Constitutional and International Law, St. Petersburg University of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of Russia	Russia
12.10	Lunch	

13.20	<i>Social Dumping or Trafficking?</i> Knut Bråttvik, Police Superintendent, National Criminal Investigation Service (KRIPOS)	Norway
13.50	Migration And Profiling  <i>Irregular Migration, Borders and Profiling</i> Ago Tikk, Border Guard Major, Head of Risk Analysis Division, Intelligence Bureau,  Border Guard Department, Police and Border Guard Board <i>Combating Trafficking in Human Beings on Example of Criminal Police</i> Ago Leis, Police Captain, Head of Division, Investigation Bureau, National Criminal Police, Police and Border Guard Board	Estonia      Estonia
14.40	Break	
15.10	Panel Discussion: Victim Or Victimized  Chair: Maria-Pia de Palo, Senior Adviser, Nordic Council of Ministers Panelists: Sirle Blumberg, Director, NGO Living for Tomorrow Arturs Vaišļa, Expert Petri Lampu, Detective Chief Inspector Sergei Andreitco, Professor of Constitutional and International Law Kati Miira, State Prosecutor Laima Garneliene, Judge	Estonia Latvia Finland Russia Estonia Lithuania
16.10	Roundtable Discussions In Groups:  <i>Identification of Victims and Criminals – Why We Do not Notice Them?</i> Police & Prosecutors & Border Guards/ Representatives of International Organizations & NGOs & Civil Servants	
17.10	Closing of the Day	
19.00	Reception in Tallinn Teachers' House (Town Hall Square 14)	

## 31 May

09.00	Benefits Of Networking  Jarle Bjørke, Police Superintendent, Head of Analysis Division, Organized Crime Section, Bergen Police  Andres Väliste, Chief Inspector, Senior Investigator, Division of Organised and Serious Crime, Crime Bureau, North Prefecture, Police and Border Guard Board	Norway   Estonia
09.30	<i>European Strategy for the Baltic Sea Region (EUSBSR): Bilateral Co-operation Between Lithuania and Norwegian Police in Cases Related to THB</i> Knut Bråttvik, Police Superintendent, National Criminal Investigation Service (KRIPOS)	Norway
09.45	Early Identification: Case Erik Petri Lampu, Detective Chief Inspector, Senior Investigator, South-West Finland Police	Finland
10.15	Joint Task Force To Combat Human Trafficking:  Cooperation Between Police and Tax Authorities in Denmark Carsten Ahrends, Police Superintendent, Copenhagen Police, Central Investigation Department  John Vorbeck Petersen, Project Manager, Danish Customs and Tax Administration	   Denmark  Denmark
11.15	Summary & Closing	
11.30	Brunch	

# Sammanfattning

De nordiska samarbetsministrarna (MR-SAM) godkände år 2011 ett program för Nordiska ministerrådets (NMR) gemensam insats för att bekämpa människohandel i EU:s Nordliga Dimensions Region. Sedan 2001 har NMR aktivt bekämpat människohandel inom det nordiska samarbetet och i samarbete med de baltiska länderna och Nordvästra Ryssland. Kampen mot människohandel kräver både internationellt samarbete och koordinering för att vara effektiv. NMR samarbetar med internationella organisationer och task-force för att undvika överlappning av aktiviteter.

I de nordiska länderna idag handlar de flesta rapporterade människohandelsfall om kvinnor och flickor som handlas för sexuellt utnyttjande, men erfarenheterna från Europa visar att människohandel för arbete inom lantbruk, hushåll, byggnadsarbete och husbygge, såväl som tiggeri, butikssnatteri och stölder har ökat.

*Trafficking in Human Beings with a Focus on Forced Labor, Children and Sex Trafficking* är ett kunskps- och nätverksuppbyggande projekt och är en del av NMR:s gemensamma insats för att bekämpa människohandel 2011–2013 i regionen för EU:s Nordliga dimension.

Ändamålet med projektet har varit att presentera nordiska, baltiska och ryska insatser och bästa metoder, som poliser och gränspoliser använder i kampen mot människohandel i Norden, Estland, Lettland, Litauen och Nordvästra Ryssland. Projektet har samlat experter från polis och gränspolis och representanter för olika myndigheter och organisationer, som dagligen arbetar med frågeställningar kring människohandel och syftar till att bygga upp kunskap och kompetens om bekämpning av människohandel. Projektet har satt fokus på nya former av människohandel som tvångsarbete och människohandel med barn. Nya trender av människohandel för sexuellt utnyttjande har även diskuterats.

Målet med det nordisk-baltisk-nordvästryska projektet har också varit att stärka det regionala operationella nätverket, som bekämpar människohandel, genom att arrangerar gemensamma studiebesök till Estland, Finland, Norge och Sverige. Studiebesöken arrangerades under 2012–2013 till Helsingfors, Stockholm, Oslo, Tallinn och Narva.

Konferensen *Identification of victims and criminals – why we do not notice them*, som arrangerades den 30th–31st maj 2013 i Tallinn, Est-

land avslutade det nordisk-baltisk-nordvästryska samarbetsprojektet som hade pågått i över ett år. Inom ramen av projektets studiebesöksprogram, tjänstemän och experter fick bekanta sig med insatser och framgångar som uppnåtts i samband med identifiering av offren som en del av kampen mot människohandel. Omkring 80 personer deltog i tvådagarskonferensen för att diskutera hur identifiera offer och kriminella och för att finna svar på frågan varför vi inte ser offer och kriminella, fastän vi idag har fakta, statistik, forskning och kunskap om människohandel som en del av den internationella organiserade kriminaliteten. Projektet har koordinerats av Nordic-Baltic Network of Policewomen (NBNP) och har administrerats av NMR kontoret i Estland.

NBNP administrerade och koordinerade i 2009–2010 ett kunskaps- och nätverksuppbyggande project om *Efforts to combat trafficking in human beings for sexual exploitation*. Studiebesök fokuserade på människohandel och på hur polis, institutioner och experter har utvecklat system för att bekämpa människohandel i nordliga delen av Europa. Som ett resultat skapades ett nordisk-baltisk-ryskt nätverk för poliser som dagligen arbetar med att bekämpa människohandel. Detta projekt har varit ett steg vidare för att stärka den nordisk-baltiska-ryska plattformen för att bekämpa människohandel i regionen för den Nordliga Dimensionen i EU.

Denna rapport innehåller en sammanställning av konferensen, inklusive sammanställningar av presentationerna, paneldiskussionen och rundabordssamtalens rekommendationer. Konferensprogrammet ses i bilaga 1.

Alla presentationer finns tillgängliga på hemsidan för Nordiska ministerrådets kontor i Estland. <http://www.norden.ee/en/welfare-society/presentations>



norden

Nordic Council of Ministers

Ved Stranden 18  
DK-1061 Copenhagen K  
[www.norden.org](http://www.norden.org)

TemaNord 2014:526

## Trafficking in Human Beings

In the Nordic countries, most of the reported cases of trafficking in human beings today concern women and girls trafficked for sexual exploitation, but experiences from Europe indicate that human trafficking has increased also in farming, household work, construction, and house building, as well as in begging, shoplifting and thefts.

The conference *Identification of victims and criminals – why we do not notice them* on 30–31 May 2013 in Tallinn, Estonia formed the conclusion of a Nordic-Baltic-Northwest Russian cooperation project. Around 80 participants attended the two-day conference to discuss ways of identifying victims and criminals and to find answer to the question of why we do not notice victims or criminals, even though we now have available to us facts, figures, research and knowledge about human trafficking as a part of international organized crime.

TemaNord 2014:526  
ISBN 978-92-893-2767-1  
ISBN 978-92-893-2768-8 (EPUB)  
ISSN 0908-6692



9 789289 327657

